

HISTORIC SITES REVIEW COMMITTEE (HSRC) – The meeting was conducted via Zoom.

Wednesday, March 13, 2024

A. CALL TO ORDER PUBLIC SESSION / AND ROLL CALL

1. Vice Chair, Ryden called the meeting to order at 1:05 PM

B. ROLL CALL/INTRODUCTION OF MEMBERS AND STAFF

HSRC Committee Members Present

Terry Majewski, Chair (arrived at 1:45 p.m.)
Don Ryden, Vice Chair
Karl Hoerig
Taz Khatri
Margaret Hangan
Bill Otwell

HSRC Committee Members Absent

Doug Kupel
Lucas Lindsey
John Southard

SHPO Staff Members Present

Kathryn Leonard
William (Bill) Collins
Susan Lawson
Eric Vondy
Arianna Urban
Joseph Roth
Jessica Lapota
Theresa Cano

Guests

Vincent Murray, Arizona Historical Research
Ann Donahue
Julia Taggart, Sunnyslope Historical Society member
Jodi Brown - City of Tucson, Historic Preservation Officer
Helana Ruter – City of Phoenix, Historic Preservation Officer
Margaret Baker
Andrew Abraham, lawyer representing City of Phoenix Aviation Department
Annie Lutes, SWCA report author
Courtney Perez
Dan Herrick, SWCA report author
Donna Reiner
Ian Milliken, Pima County
James Truman
Jordan Field, City of Phoenix Aviation Dept.
Karen Krause
Lisa Hagarty

Roger Brevoort
Roxann Favors, City of Phoenix Aviation Dept.
Scott O'Mack
Woody Thomas
Jay DeWitt
Adrienne Tremblay

C. NEW BUSINESS

(The meeting's original agenda order for **NEW BUSINESS** was rearranged to allow for committee chair Majewski to participate in items #1 and #3, as listed on the original agenda, as she was running late due to a scheduling conflict. According to the original agenda, items were done in the following order: #2, #4, #1, #3, and #5-#9. The minutes reflect the updated order.)

NEW NATIONAL REGISTER NOMINATIONS

1. Snyder, Dr. Bertram L., House, 8122 North 10th Avenue, Phoenix, Maricopa County, Arizona

Collins provided an overview of the Synder, Dr. Bertram L., House nomination.

MOTION TO OPEN DISCUSSION: - (00:11:31)

Hangan moved that the State Historic Preservation Officer place the **SYNDER, DR. BERTRAM L., HOUSE** on the Arizona Register of Historic Places at the **LOCAL** level of significance under **CRITERION B** and that the nomination be forwarded to the Keeper of the National Register for placement in the National Register. The motion was seconded by Otwell.

Nomination preparer, Murray was available for questions and made comments about the nomination. Taggart made comments in support of the nomination.

After open discussion, the following recommendations were made by the Committee:

- An explicit comment is needed that states that this property is the best property to represent Dr. Synder's contributions to medical practice in Phoenix specifically since most of the extant buildings at John C. Lincoln are no longer standing. Also, due to Dr. Synder serving at multiple local hospitals.
- Khatri would like to see more context and history regarding John C. Lincoln hospital. Leonard noted that no more than a paragraph is needed.

The Chair called for a vote on the motion, which passed with vote of 5-0. - (00:34:00)

Consultant should revise nomination per comments and submit to SHPO for submission to the Keeper.

ROLL CALL VOTE	
Margaret Hangan	Y
Karl Hoerig	Y
Taz Khatri	Y
Douglas Kupel	NP
Lucas Lindsey	NP
Terry Majewski	NP
Bill Otwell	Y
Don Ryden	Y
John Southard	NP

KEY

- Y - For
- N - Against
- AB - Abstained
- NP - Not Present

Chair Majewski joined the meeting at 1:45 p.m.

2. St. Michael and All Angels Episcopal Church, 602 North Wilmot Road, Tucson, Pima County, Arizona

Collins provided an overview of the St. Michael and All Angels Episcopal Church nomination.

MOTION TO OPEN DISCUSSION: - (00:38:25)

Hoerig moved that the State Historic Preservation Officer place the **ST. MICHAEL AND ALL ANGELS EPISCOPAL CHURCH** on the Arizona Register of Historic Places at the **LOCAL** level of significance under **CRITERION C** and that the nomination be forwarded to the Keeper of the National Register for placement in the National Register. The motion was seconded by Otwell.

Nomination preparers, O’Mack and Milliken were available for questions and made comments about the nomination.

After open discussion, the following recommendations were made by the Committee:

- This is a unique example of the Pueblo Revival Style.
- Otwell noted that this is a rare example of Joesler’s work and that while the additions are noncontributing, they harmonize.
- Khatri expressed that it would be helpful to have a glossary of the religious architectural terms added to the nomination.

The Chair called for a vote on the motion, which passed with vote of 6-0. - (01:03:26)

Consultant should revise nomination per comments and submit to SHPO for submission to the Keeper.

ROLL CALL VOTE	
Margaret Hangan	Y
Karl Hoerig	Y
Taz Khatri	Y
Douglas Kupel	NP
Lucas Lindsey	NP
Terry Majewski	Y
Bill Otwell	Y
Don Ryden	Y
John Southard	NP

KEY

- Y - For
- N - Against
- AB - Abstained
- NP - Not Present

Ryden recused himself at 2:12 p.m. and returned at 3:35 p.m. He recused himself from items #3 and #4.

3. Grand Avenue Commercial Historic District, Commercial area inclusive of 723-1845 Grand Avenue, 718-734 West Polk Street, 1205 West Pierce Street, 1348 West Roosevelt Street, 1107 North Laurel Street, Phoenix, Maricopa County, Arizona

Collins provided an overview of the Grand Avenue Commercial Historic District nomination.

MOTION TO OPEN DISCUSSION: - (01:10:27)

Hangan moved that the State Historic Preservation Officer place the **GRAND AVENUE COMMERCIAL HISTORIC DISTRICT** on the Arizona Register of Historic Places at the **LOCAL** level of significance under **CRITERION A** and that the nomination be forwarded to the Keeper of the National Register for placement in the National Register. The motion was seconded by Otwell.

Collins noted that a number of letters in support and a few of objection were received regarding the nomination.

Preparer, Reiner, was available for questions from the committee. Members of the public, Brevoort and Taggart made comments as well.

After open discussion, the following recommendations were made by the Committee:

- Khatri would like to see a paragraph inserted to underscore that this streetscape is unique vis-à-vis Phoenix as it has a 100-ft. right-of-way and historically, this streetscape was about moving from point A to point B.
- Hangan recommended adding a couple sentences to give some context to the Arizona State Fair’s part in Grand Avenue.

The Chair called for a vote on the motion, which passed with vote of 5-0. - (01:28:58)

Consultant should revise nomination per comments and submit to SHPO for submission to the Keeper.

ROLL CALL VOTE	
Margaret Hangan	Y
Karl Hoerig	Y
Taz Khatri	Y
Douglas Kupel	NP
Lucas Lindsey	NP
Terry Majewski	Y
Bill Otwell	Y
Don Ryden	NP
John Southard	NP

KEY

Y - For
 N - Against
 AB - Abstained
 NP - Not Present

4. Tal'-wi-wi Ranch, 9801 North Litchfield Road and 9816 North Litchfield Road, Phoenix, Maricopa County, Arizona

Collins provided an overview of the Tal'-wi-wi Ranch nomination.

MOTION TO OPEN DISCUSSION: - (01:35:51)

Khatri moved that the State Historic Preservation Officer place the **TAL'-WI-WI RANCH** on the Arizona Register of Historic Places at the **LOCAL** level of significance under **CRITERION A** and that the nomination be forwarded to the Keeper of the National Register for placement in the National Register. The motion was seconded by Hangan.

Favors, a representative for the City of Phoenix Aviation Department, spoke about the city's objection to the nomination. Abraham, lawyer from Phoenix law firm Burch & Cracchiolo representing City of Phoenix Aviation Department, spoke about legal issues regarding the property. Abraham stated that as the owner of the property the City of Phoenix objects to forwarding the nomination because the property lacks integrity. Abraham also stated that as the property owner the City of Phoenix is objecting to forwarding the nomination as a matter of record. SWCA report authors Lutes and Herrick were on hand to answer technical questions regarding the property. Herrick reiterated the findings of SWCA's report which states that the property does not retain integrity and that the nomination as written is not complete. Herrick confirmed to Leonard that the findings in SWCA's report conclude that the property is not eligible to be listed on the National Register. Members of the public, Thomas, Taggart, Truman, and Krause made comments in support of the nomination.

MOTION TO RESCIND ORIGINAL MOTION: - (02:13:14)

Khatri moved that the Historic Sites Review Committee rescind her original motion. The motion to rescind the original motion was seconded by Hangan.

The Chair called for a vote on the motion to rescind the original motion, which passed with vote of 5-0. - (02:14:56)

ROLL CALL VOTE	
Margaret Hangan	Y
Karl Hoerig	Y
Taz Khatri	Y
Douglas Kupel	NP
Lucas Lindsey	NP
Terry Majewski	Y
Bill Otwell	Y
Don Ryden	NP
John Southard	NP

KEY

- Y - For
- N - Against
- AB - Abstained
- NP - Not Present

MOTION TO OPEN DISCUSSION: - (02:17:05)

Hangan moved to recommend that the **TAL'-WI-WI RANCH** be determined eligible at the **LOCAL** level of significance under **CRITERION A** for the Arizona State and National Registers. The motion was seconded by Hoerig.

The Chair called for a vote on the motion to determine eligibility, which passed with vote of 5-0. - (02:20:45)

ROLL CALL VOTE	
Margaret Hangan	Y
Karl Hoerig	Y
Taz Khatri	Y
Douglas Kupel	NP
Lucas Lindsey	NP
Terry Majewski	Y
Bill Otwell	Y
Don Ryden	NP
John Southard	NP

KEY

- Y - For
- N - Against
- AB - Abstained
- NP - Not Present

Following a vote to determine eligibility, Leonard stated that she has not received any compelling evidence, including the SWCA report, that the property is not eligible for listing. Leonard stated that while the property is not the most beautiful, it is unique. Leonard went on to say that it is a rare surviving example of an agricultural enterprise that was doing something a little different to the extent that visiting dignitaries from other desert cities and countries were coming here to visit what was going on. Leonard noted that its significance cannot be understated. Leonard noted that it is obvious that there are integrity issues with the buildings and that those issues are not brought forth adequately in the draft of the nomination that was submitted. Leonard is optimistic that the nomination can be remedied to capture integrity issues more accurately. Leonard stated that she feels that the SWCA report's findings do not add up. Leonard stated that she had not decided whether or not to forward the recommendation to the keeper.

Abraham noted that the sworn objection does state specifically that the city is the owner of private property. The mere fact that it's owned by a public entity doesn't make a public property just like Federal lands.

Leonard thanked Abraham for bringing that to her attention. Leonard said she would bring that to the keeper of the Register and get their opinion on that. Leonard said that she needed to get a legal opinion on that as well. Leonard noted that her preference is to have a conversation with the city and see if a solution that honors the history of Arizona and the people of the West Valley, and people in the State of Arizona who wish to see this preserved can be reached.

5. **El Montevideo Historic District (Additional Documentation) – Reclassification to Noncontributor, 3837 East Calle Cortez, Tucson, Pima County, Arizona**
6. **Broadmoor Historic District (Additional Documentation) – Reclassification to Contributors, 433 South Stratford Drive and 442 South Stratford Drive, Tucson, Pima County, Arizona**
7. **Blenman-Elm Historic District (Additional Documentation) – Reclassification to Noncontributor, 1625 North Stewart Street, Tucson, Pima County, Arizona**
8. **Winterhaven Historic District (Additional Documentation) – Reclassification to Contributor, 3335 North Christmas Avenue, Tucson, Pima County, Arizona**
9. **Fraser Fields Historic District (Additional Documentation) – Reclassification to Contributor, 67 North Fraser Drive E, Mesa, Maricopa County, Arizona**

Chair Majewski asked the committee if they had any objections for compressing items 5-9 on a consent agenda. No objections were noted.

MOTION TO OPEN DISCUSSION: - (01:58:23)

Ryden moved that the Historic Sites Review Committee approve the staff recommendations for items 5, 6, 7, 8, and 9 on the revised agenda be accepted and that the recommendation is that the State Historic Preservation Officer forward these recommendations to the Keeper of the National Register for action. The motion was seconded by Otwell.

The Chair called for a vote on the motion, which passed with vote of 6-0. - (01:59:23)

Staff recommended changes should be submitted by SHPO to the Keeper.

ROLL CALL VOTE	
Margaret Hangan	Y
Karl Hoerig	Y
Taz Khatri	Y
Douglas Kupel	NP
Lucas Lindsey	NP
Terry Majewski	Y
Bill Otwell	Y
Don Ryden	Y
John Southard	NP

KEY

- Y - For
- N - Against
- AB - Abstained
- NP - Not Present

D. OLD BUSINESS:

1. APPROVAL OF MINUTES FROM NOVEMBER 3, 2023 HSRC MEETING

MOTION: Khatri called for a motion to accept the minutes with a correction to the date listed on the agenda from November 11 to November 3. The motion was seconded by Otwell. – (02:30:43)

The chair called for a vote on the motion, and it was passed by a vote of 6-0. - (02:31:34)

ROLL CALL VOTE	
Margaret Hangan	Y
Karl Hoerig	Y
Taz Khatri	Y
Douglas Kupel	NP
Lucas Lindsey	NP
Terry Majewski	Y
Bill Otwell	Y
Don Ryden	Y
John Southard	NP

KEY

Y - For

N - Against

AB - Abstained

NP - Not Present

E. Discussion and planning for proposed HSRC Session at 2024 Arizona Historic Preservation Conference (no action)

Khatri and Leonard suggested discussing nominations that challenge the committee to examine the concept of what is register eligible and look at integrity issues.

Khatri left the meeting at 4:01 p.m.

F. PROGRAM REPORTS

1. SHPO REPORT

a. National Register update, listings, property status, workflow -

Collins reported that since the November 3, 2023 HSRC meeting Properties Listed in National Register include: El Dorado Lodge, Tucson; University of Arizona Campus Agricultural Center, Tucson; Windes Farmstead, Phoenix; Westwood Village and Estates Historic District (Additional Documentation), Phoenix; Seargeant-Oldaker House (request to relocate), Phoenix; Oakland Historic District (Additional Documentation), Phoenix; Winterhaven Historic District (Additional Documentation), Tucson; and Catalina Vista Historic District (Additional Documentation), Tucson.

b. SHPO Staffing and Program News -

Leonard reported that SHPO has a new archeologist, Dave Zimmerman. Funding for the position comes from the US Forest Service and is for a five-year term. The Site Steward Program has an upcoming regional training at the Huhugam Heritage Center on April 13, 2024. The training is primarily for stewards in the Central and Agua Fria regions. SHPO’s State Tax Reclassification Program is reaching a high volume which requires a staffing solution and other efficiency improvements to keep up with the growing program’s pace. When the program was established, it

was anticipated that there would be one thousand homeowners in the program, currently there are over nine thousand registered and counting.

c. Review and Compliance -

Leonard reported that SHPO is working with the Commerce Authority to get one billion dollars worth of broadband into the ground in rural Arizona. The project involves coordination with many land jurisdictions, Section 106, NEPA, and tribal consultation. It involves federal funds with a short expiration date, so it is stressful. NTIA (National Telecommunications and Information Administration) is the lead federal agency for this undertaking. Arizona Snowbowl continues to be a big concern for tribes in northern Arizona. SHPO is almost at the point where they are ready to execute an agreement document, but there have been some last-minute objections from multiple tribes. Leonard stated that she is trying to be the intermediary between the Forest Service and the tribes. The advisory council is involved in the Snowbowl project as well. Another big project for SHPO involves the Surface Transportation Board projection in the East Valley over the Germain site where there was some unauthorized disturbance during the consultation process for Section 106 which has foreclosed on the opportunity to resolve an adverse effect that the project would create.

d. Survey and Inventory -

Nothing to report.

e. Grants -

Nothing to report.

f. Legislative Issues –

Federal level – Nothing new to report.

State level – Leonard reported that SHPO had been closely tracking a concurrent resolution of Senate and House to appropriate the Heritage Fund permanently. It went through the House without issue, but was killed in the Senate. SHPO only received one applicant in the last round of funding, so SHPO will go to a third round of funding for Heritage Fund where there is approximately \$200,000 left.

g. HP 2024 Conference update –

Leonard reported the Arizona Historic Preservation Conference will be held in Prescott from June 25-27. The theme for the conference is “Planning the Past, Preserving the Future.” The keynote speaker will Bonnie McDonald from Landmarks, IL. Leonard will be the plenary speaker.

2. AHAC REPORT

Vondy reported that the one grant that was submitted for the Heritage Fund passed. The Buffalo Soldiers memorial was passed after about two years of trying to get it done. It has now moved onto legislative council for design.

G. PUBLIC COMMENT:

Taggart made a suggestion for item E on the agenda which was to include a discussion about community outreach regarding the National Register. Milliken reported that Pima County as a CLG is robustly looking at priority cultural resources and identify and list at least one county property every year.

H. CALL FOR AGENDA ITEMS FOR NEXT COMMITTEE MEETING:

Collins reported that he has a couple nominations ready for the next meeting.

I. ADJOURNED:

The Chair called the meeting adjourned at 4:13 p.m.

Minutes prepared by: Theresa Cano, State Historic Preservation Office
and was posted on Monday, March 25, 2024.

Minutes are considered draft until official approved by the Committee at the next scheduled meeting