

HISTORIC SITES REVIEW COMMITTEE (HSRC)

Friday, July 14, 2023

A. CALL TO ORDER PUBLIC SESSION / AND ROLL CALL

1. Vice Chair, Ryden called the meeting to order at 9:33 AM

B. ROLL CALL/INTRODUCTION OF MEMBERS AND STAFF

HSRC Committee Members Present

Terry Majewski, Chair - attended by phone
Don Ryden, Vice Chair
Karl Hoerig
Doug Kupel
Taz Khatri
John Southard – attended by phone
Margaret Hangan – attended by phone
Bill Otwell – attended by phone

HSRC Committee Members Absent

Lucas Lindsey

SHPO Staff Members Present

Kathryn Leonard
William (Bill) Collins
Susan Lawson
Eric Vondy
Arianna Urban
Joseph Roth
Jessica Lapota
Konrad Howard
Theresa Cano

Guests

Demion Clinco – attended by phone
Jodi Brown – attended by phone
Karen Young
John Lacey
Wendy Davis
Margaret Baker

C. NEW BUSINESS

NEW NATIONAL REGISTER NOMINATIONS

1. Wilshire Heights Historic District, Residential area east of Craycroft Road between Broadway Boulevard and 22nd Street, Tucson, Pima County, Arizona

Collins provided an overview of the Wilshire Heights Historic District nomination.

MOTION TO OPEN DISCUSSION: - (00:10:15)

Kupel moved that the State Historic Preservation Officer place the **WILSHIRE HEIGHTS HISTORIC DISTRICT** on the Arizona Register of Historic Places at the **LOCAL** level of significance under **CRITERION A and C** and that the nomination be forwarded to the Keeper of the National Register for placement in the National Register. The motion was seconded by Southard.

The preparer, Clinco, was available via phone for questions from the committee.

- Clinco said that his justification for Criterion A were community planning and architecture. He noted how this development played a part in the post WWII development of the east side of Tucson. He also noted the two phased development where the first phase included architect-designed sub-division and in the second phase, builder-designed.

After open discussion, the following recommendations were made by the Committee:

- Ryden asked Lawson to summarize the written comments that she submitted to committee members before the meeting regarding the nomination. Lawson noted that she would like to see more descriptions of individual properties in the district. Other SHPO comments included the lack of substantive description of the district in Section 7 including its characteristic features and the nature of its architecture. In Section 8, there is no description of what the named architects did in this neighborhood. The nomination is more outline and needs more description.
- Khatri noted that while there lots of descriptive paragraphs, the information wasn't really of the district and didn't make the case for the nomination stronger. Khatri would like to see a stronger case made for Criterion A.
- Khatri also mentioned spelling errors and typos that needed to be cleaned up before the nomination moves to the preparer.
- Ryden would like to see more of a case made for what exactly makes this district eligible.
- Khatri felt that the case for Criterion C was strong.
- Leonard noted the leap-frog development pattern and the involvement of the Jewish community. Would like to see more information about these issues.
- Kupel noted that he doesn't feel that the nomination is ready for "prime time." Kupel noted that the park is not adequately described and evaluated.
- Kupel said that there are too many mistakes in the nomination and it used too many excerpts. Would like to know if all the buildings have carports. Also, are carports a character-defining feature?
- Southard suggested reducing extraneous material and polish up the statement of significance.
- Hangan would like to see more information about the Chinese architect.

- Ryden would like to see better descriptions of substyles with the addition of photos.
- Ryden clarification needed as to why Williams addition was never built. Khatri wanted more information on deed restrictions, i.e. were they specific to certain races?

The Chair called for a vote on the motion, which failed with vote of 8-0. - (00:46:25)

The Committee would like to see the nomination again with revisions and corrections.

ROLL CALL VOTE	
Margaret Hangan	N
Karl Hoerig	N
Taz Khatri	N
Douglas Kupel	N
Lucas Lindsey	NP
Terry Majewski	N
Bill Otwell	N
Don Ryden	N
John Southard	N

KEY

- Y - For
- N - Against
- AB - Abstained
- NP - Not Present

2. El Dorado Lodge, 6400 East El Dorado Circle, Tucson, Pima County, Arizona

Collins provided an overview of the El Dorado Lodge nomination.

MOTION TO OPEN DISCUSSION: - (00:52:19)

Kupel moved that the State Historic Preservation Officer place the **EL DORADO LODGE** on the Arizona Register of Historic Places at the **LOCAL** level of significance under **CRITERION A and C** and that the nomination be forwarded to the Keeper of the National Register for placement in the National Register. The motion was seconded by Southard.

Lacey and Young were available for questions about the nomination.

After open discussion, the following recommendations were made by the Committee:

- Khatri would like to explore a national level of significance for the nomination due to the property’s connection with the Jewish community.
- Need better description of how the property articulates with its landscape and surroundings.
- Consistency with use of name.
- Diagrams needed to show chronological development.
- Provide map to show all additions and their dates.
- Clarify what is contributing.
- Research/provide names of any prominent Jewish families that might be associated with the property.
- Provide additional information about original owner, Ms. Pond.
- Provide information about health seekers/East Coast Jewish families.

The Chair called for a vote on the motion, which passed with vote of 8-0. - (01:28:56)

Consultant should revise nomination per comments and submit to SHPO for submission to the Keeper.

ROLL CALL VOTE	
Margaret Hangan	Y
Karl Hoerig	Y
Taz Khatri	Y
Douglas Kupel	Y
Lucas Lindsey	NP
Terry Majewski	Y
Bill Otwell	Y
Don Ryden	Y
John Southard	Y

KEY

- Y - For
- N - Against
- AB - Abstained
- NP - Not Present

3. Blenman-Elm Historic District (Additional Documentation) – Reclassification to non-contributor, 2820 East Adams Street, Tucson, Pima County, Arizona

Collins provided an overview of additional documentation for the property at 2820 East Adams Street, Tucson, Arizona in the Blenman-Elm Historic District.

MOTION TO OPEN DISCUSSION: - (01:32:32)

Kupel moved that the Historic Sites Review Committee accept the staff recommendations at the building at **2820 EAST ADAMS STREET, TUCSON** in the **BLNMAN-ELM HISTORIC DISTRICT** be classified as a non-contributor to the district and we recommend that the State Historic Preservation Officer forward these recommendations to the Keeper of the National Register for action. The motion was seconded by Khatri.

Brown was available for questions.

Collins noted that the property has made several alterations which have resulted in a loss of integrity including an enclosed carport turned into living space and replacement of steel casement windows.

The Chair called for a vote on the motion, which passed with vote of 8-0. - (01:46:27)

Staff recommended changes should be submitted by SHPO to the Keeper.

ROLL CALL VOTE	
Margaret Hangan	Y
Karl Hoerig	Y
Taz Khatri	Y
Douglas Kupel	Y
Lucas Lindsey	NP
Terry Majewski	Y
Bill Otwell	Y
Don Ryden	Y
John Southard	Y

KEY

- Y - For
- N - Against
- AB - Abstained
- NP - Not Present

4. South Prescott Townsite Historic District (Additional Documentation) – Reclassification to non-contributing, 225 South Cortez Street, Prescott, Yavapai County, Arizona

Collins provided an overview of additional documentation for the property at 225 South Cortez Street, Prescott, Arizona in the South Prescott Townsite Historic District.

MOTION TO OPEN DISCUSSION: - (01:48:43)

Kupel moved that the Historic Sites Review Committee accept the staff recommendations at the building at **818 ½ EAST SPEEDWAY BOULEVARD, TUCSON** in the **SOUTH PRESCOTT TOWNSITE HISTORIC DISTRICT** be classified as a non-contributor to the district and we recommend that the State Historic Preservation Officer forward these recommendations to the Keeper of the National Register for action. The motion was seconded by Khatri.

Collins noted that the property has been demolished.

The Chair called for a vote on the motion, which passed with vote of 8-0. - (01:51:40)

ROLL CALL VOTE	
Margaret Hangan	Y
Karl Hoerig	Y
Taz Khatri	Y
Douglas Kupel	Y
Lucas Lindsey	NP
Terry Majewski	Y
Bill Otwell	Y
Don Ryden	Y
John Southard	Y

KEY

- Y - For
- N - Against
- AB - Abstained
- NP - Not Present

**5. Coronado Neighborhood Historic District (Additional Documentation) –
Reclassification to contributing, 942 and 946 East Coronado Road and 1650
North 10th Street, Phoenix, Maricopa County, Arizona**

Collins provided an overview of additional documentation for the properties at 942 and 946 East Coronado Road and 1650 North 10th Street, Phoenix, Arizona in the Coronado Neighborhood Historic District.

MOTION TO OPEN DISCUSSION: - (01:54:30)

Kupel moved that the Historic Sites Review Committee accept the staff recommendations at the building at **942 AND 946 EAST CORONADO ROAD AND 1650 NORTH 10th STREET, PHOENIX in the CORONADO NEIGHBORHOOD HISTORIC DISTRICT** be classified as a contributing to the district and we recommend that the State Historic Preservation Officer forward these recommendations to the Keeper of the National Register for action. The motion was seconded by Khatri.

The Chair called for a vote on the motion, which passed with vote of 8-0. - (02:01:00)

ROLL CALL VOTE	
Margaret Hangan	Y
Karl Hoerig	Y
Taz Khatri	Y
Douglas Kupel	Y
Lucas Lindsey	NP
Terry Majewski	Y
Bill Otwell	Y
Don Ryden	Y
John Southard	Y

KEY

Y - For

N - Against

AB - Abstained

NP - Not Present

D. OLD BUSINESS:

1. APPROVAL OF MINUTES FROM MARCH 3, 2023 HSRC MEETING

MOTION: Kupel called for a motion to accept the minutes with minor fixes. The motion was seconded by Hangan. – (02:02:52)

The chair called for a vote on the motion, and it was passed by a vote of 6-0, with two abstaining. - (02:04:13)

ROLL CALL VOTE	
Margaret Hangan	Y
Karl Hoerig	Y
Taz Khatri	AB
Douglas Kupel	Y
Lucas Lindsey	NP
Terry Majewski	Y
Bill Otwell	AB
Don Ryden	Y
John Southard	Y

KEY

- Y - For
- N - Against
- AB - Abstained
- NP - Not Present

E. 2023 HISTORIC PRESERVATION CONFERENCE SESSION PLANNING DISCUSSION:

Collins discussed having a session with HSRC members to discuss interesting properties and issues that the committee has dealt with over the past year.

F. PROGRAM REPORTS

1. SHPO REPORT

a. National Register update, listings, property status, workflow -

Collins reported that since the March 3, 2023 HSRC meeting Properties Listed in National Register include: Ainsworth House, Phoenix; Schuerman Homestead House, Sedona; Connor-Harold House, Phoenix; Feldman’s Historic District (Additional Documentation); Blenman-Elm Historic District (Additional Documentation); Portland Street Historic District (Additional Documentation); Miracle Mile Historic District (Additional Documentation); Catalina Vista Historic District (Additional Documentation)

b. SHPO Staffing and Program News -

Leonard reported that SHPO submitted comment to the National Park Service on their amendment to Bulletin 38 which is the bulletin on Traditional Cultural Properties. Leonard believes that NPS will be making another revision based on collective comments from SHPOs nationwide. Leonard reported that members of the SHPO staff attended the Juneteenth celebration in the community of Randolph, Arizona. Nomination preparer Jen Levstik partnered with Arizona State University Community Archives attended as well. ASU’s team helped community members learn how to archive their photos, stories, and memorabilia which can be used to help strengthen the nomination. Levstik took one or two more oral histories at the event. Leonard noted that she took video at the event as well. Lapota was introduced as SHPO’s new Grants Coordinator. SHPO put out a RFI to assist SHPO with developing an enterprise database that will have a GIS component. A consultant has been hired to assist with SHPO’s comprehensive Historic Preservation Plan. Multiple sessions at the HPC are planned to have stakeholder engagement in the Historic Preservation Plan. Osterman Gas Station on the Hualapai Nation in Peach Springs was listed as one of America’s 11 Most Endangered Historic Places in 2023.

c. Review and Compliance -

Leonard reported that SHPO is working with GSA in the process of transferring federal ownership of the Titan Missile #4 to Pima County. Leonard noted that once a property leaves federal ownership it is an Adverse Effect. Leonard noted that proper documentation will be critical. SHPO

is working with the Fish and Wildlife Service on a big project by Lake Roosevelt where they are constructing additional holding facilities for water. They are currently working on the EA for that project. Leonard reported that SHPO is continuing to work with the tribes and the Forest Service on the MOA for Snowbowl. The USFS has notified SHPO that a significant amount of work coming down the pipeline including the Replant Act which is a large-scale fuels reduction effort across our forests. Leonard reported that will mean a large influx of consultations for SHPO. Conversations also include the possibility of supplemental support from the Forest Service for SHPO's programs. IJJA is hitting SHPO's compliance team hard, work includes everything from roads and bridges to broadband.

d. Survey and Inventory -

Nothing to report.

e. Grants -

Leonard reported that Lapota is doing a great job managing SHPO's current grants. The legislature appropriated \$5 million for the Heritage Fund, which means \$1.6 million is available for Historic Heritage projects. The next grants cycle will open in September.

f. Legislative Issues –

Federal level – Nothing new to report.

State level – Two new state parks have been announced; one by Camp Verde and the other will be in north Maricopa County.

g. HP 2023 Conference update –

Leonard reported that the HPC's theme will be "History in the Balance." Leonard named the keynote speakers, which include Lydia Otero, a University of Arizona professor, and Adrian Scott Fine of the L.A. Conservancy. The conference will take place from October 25-28, 2023 in Tucson.

2. AHAC REPORT

Majewski reported that AHAC has been busy this year. They met in November to review the Heritage Fund Grants. They also met in December and named a new chair, Susan Shaffer.

G. PUBLIC COMMENT:

None

H. CALL FOR AGENDA ITEMS FOR NEXT COMMITTEE MEETING:

Nothing new to report.

I. ADJOURNED:

The Vice-Chair called the meeting adjourned at 12:11 p.m.

Minutes prepared by: Theresa Cano, State Historic Preservation Office
and was posted on Monday, July 24, 2023

Minutes are considered draft until official approved by the Committee at the next scheduled meeting