

HISTORIC SITES REVIEW COMMITTEE

**1110 West Washington Street, Suite 250,
Phoenix, Arizona
Friday, March 24, 2017**

A. CALL TO ORDER PUBLIC SESSION

1. Chair Terry Majewski called the meeting to order at 9:40 AM

B. ROLL CALL / INTRODUCTION OF MEMBERS AND STAFF - (00:28)

HSRC Committee Members Present

Terry Majewski, Chair
Don Ryden, Vice Chair
John Jacquemart
Doug Kupel
Jan Balsom
Brooks Jeffery
John Southard

HSRC Committee Members Absent

John Lacy
Winston Thorne

SHPO Staff Members Present

Kathryn Leonard
William (Bill) Collins
Eric Vondy
Joe Roth
Margy Parisella

Guests

Michelle Dodds, City of Phoenix
Jodey Elsner, City of Phoenix
Demion Clinco, Tucosn Historic Preservation Foundation
Bob Graham, Architect
Sherry McKracken, Owner
Travis Benton, Peirson Place Homeowners Association
Chris Harris, Owner
John Spellman, Owner
Alyssa Gerszewski (via teleconference)

C. NEW BUSINESS

1. DISCUSSION AND ACTION REGARDING FORMAT OF HISTORIC SITES REVIEW COMMITTEE MOTIONS - (3:27)

Over the past few meetings the Committee discussed and tested different modifications of the form of motions used to open discussion and make recommendation for listing of properties on the State and National Registers of Historic Places. John Lacy reviewed the format from a legal standpoint and advised SHPO that since the new formats have proven to be problematic, just to revert back to the original format of the motions.

2. NEW NATIONAL REGISTER NOMINATIONS

a. **DOME HOUSE, Cave Creek, Maricopa County, Arizona** - (5:06)

Bill Collins provided an overview of the Dome House nomination.

Alyssa Gerszewski was present via teleconference to address Committee questions.

MOTION TO OPEN DISCUSSION: (7:25)

Jan Balson moved to recommend that the State Historic Preservation Office place the **DOME HOUSE** on the Arizona Register of Historic Places under **CRITERION C** at the **LOCAL** level of significance and that the nomination be forwarded to the Keeper of the National Register for placement in the National Register. The motion was seconded by Brooks Jeffery.

After discussion, the following recommendations that were agreed upon by the Committee:

- Style needs to be revised to reflect uniqueness of the building. Deemphasize International Style in favor of Soleri and Mills' unique application of Wrightian Organicism. Would be the National Register's "Other" category.
- Need for additional documentation on both architects, Soleri and Mill.
- Do not use the term "master" when referring to Soleri as he was then only a former student on a first project.
- Place in context of Soleri's work. This was largely a failed experiment of designing for the desert that would influence his thinking towards the later Cosanti and Arcosanti.

The Chair called for a vote and on the motion as originally stated and it was turned down with a vote of 1-6. - (33:09)

Comments to be forwarded to the preparer for revision, and re-submission to Committee.

b. **PEMERTON HOUSE, 1121 N 2ND St, Phoenix, Maricopa County, Arizona** - (34:04)

Bill Collins provided an overview of the Pemberton House nomination.

Bob Graham, Sherry McKracken & Michelle Dodds were present to address Committee questions.

MOTION TO OPEN DISCUSSION: (36:55)

Brooks Jeffery moved to recommend that the State Historic Preservation Office place the **PEMBERTON HOUSE** on the Arizona Register of Historic Places under **CRITERIA A & C** at the **LOCAL** level of significance and that the nomination be forwarded to the Keeper of the National Register for placement in the National Register. The motion was seconded by John Jacquemart.

After discussion, the following recommendations that were agreed upon by the Committee:

- Remove criterion A from nomination.
- The National Register architectural category would be "Other," with the text describing it as Foursquare with Prairie influence.
- Revise period of significance to year of construction.
- Add photos of interior of building and exterior with original windows.
- Address SHPO staff and City of Phoenix Comments.

AMENDED MOTION: (48:03)

Brooks Jeffery agreed to amend his motion to remove criterion A from the nomination. The Secunder, John Jacquemart concurred with the amendment.

The chair called for a vote on the amended motion and it was passed unanimously (7-0). - (46:04)

c. HILGEMAN HOUSE, 333 W Loma Ln., Phoenix, Maricopa County, Arizona - (48:45)

Bill Collins provided an overview of the Hilgeman House nomination.

Michelle Dodds and John Spellman were present to address Committee questions.

MOTION TO OPEN DISCUSSION: (51:45)

Don Ryden moved to recommend that the State Historic Preservation Office place the **HILGEMAN HOUSE** on the Arizona Register of Historic Places under **CRITERIA A & C** at the **LOCAL** level of significance and that the nomination be forwarded to the Keeper of the National Register for placement in the National Register. The motion was seconded by John Southard.

After discussion, the following recommendations that were agreed upon by the Committee:

- Remove criterion A from nomination.
- The appropriate National Register architectural classification would be “Other,” with the emphasis in the text on the builder’s unique construction method and materials. Influenced by popular styles of the time, but a vernacular expression.
- Period of significance would be 1924 when the building was completed.
- Address SHPO comments.

AMENDED MOTION: (1:09:48)

Don Ryden agreed to amend his motion to submit the nomination under criterion C only. The Secunder, John Southard concurred with the amendment.

The chair called for a vote on the amended motion and it was passed unanimously (7-0). - (1:10:16)

d. PEIRSON PLACE HISTORIC DISTRICT, Phoenix, Maricopa County, Arizona - (1:11:01)

Bill Collins provided an overview of the Peirson Place nomination.

Jodey Elsner and Travis Benton were present to address Committee questions.

MOTION TO OPEN DISCUSSION: (1:15:10)

Brooks Jeffery moved to recommend that the State Historic Preservation Office place the **PEIRSON PLACE HISTORIC DISTRICT** on the Arizona Register of Historic Places under **CRITERIA A & C** at the **LOCAL** level of significance and that the nomination be forwarded to the Keeper of the National Register for placement in the National Register. The motion was seconded by Jan Balsom.

After discussion, the following recommendations that were agreed upon by the Committee:

- Revise description to better define what ties the neighborhood together and makes it unique.
- Address SHPO comments.
- Should be more comparison with other developers and subdivisions, such as the nearby Medlock Place.
- Important issues such as FHA guidelines and development of the Ranch style, irrigation systems are important and many are addressed in the MPDF.
- Might be valuable to chart the evolution of automobile accommodations, carports, garages, etc.

The chair called for a vote on the motion and it was passed unanimously (7-0). - (01:41:00)

e. **WARREN BISBEE BUS #8, Tucson, Pima County, Arizona** - (1:41:55)

Bill Collins provided an overview of the Warren Bisbee Bus #8 nomination.

Demion Clinco was present to address Committee questions.

MOTION TO OPEN DISCUSSION: (1:45:22)

Brooks Jeffery moved to recommend that the State Historic Preservation Office place the **WARREN BISBEE BUS #8** on the Arizona Register of Historic Places under **CRITERION C** at the **LOCAL** level of significance and that the nomination be forwarded to the Keeper of the National Register for placement in the National Register. The motion was seconded by Don Ryden.

After discussion, the Committee had no comments or suggested revisions for the nomination.

The chair called for a vote on the motion and it was passed unanimously (7-0). - (02:05:43)

(BREAK - Timecodes reset for part 2)

f. **CRAIG HOUSE, Tucson vicinity, Pima County, Arizona** - (PT 2 - 00:06)

Bill Collins provided an overview of the Craig House nomination.

Demion Clinco was present to address Committee questions.

MOTION TO OPEN DISCUSSION: (PT 2 - 04:49)

Doug Kupel moved to recommend that the State Historic Preservation Office place the **CRAIG HOUSE** on the Arizona Register of Historic Places under **CRITERION C** at the **LOCAL** level of significance and that the nomination be forwarded to the Keeper of the National Register for placement in the National Register. The motion was seconded by John Southard.

After discussion, the following recommendations that were agreed upon by the Committee:

- Address the commonality of the relocation/reorientation of entrances associated with Joesler properties.
- Address SHPO comments.

The chair called for a vote on the motion and it was passed unanimously (7-0). - (PT 2 - 19:55)

g. **DREXEL-GOULD HOUSE, Tucson vicinity, Pima County, Arizona** - (PT 2 - 20:17)

Bill Collins provided an overview of the Drexel-Gould House nomination.

Demion Clinco was present to address Committee questions.

MOTION TO OPEN DISCUSSION: (PT 2 - 23:54)

Douglas Kupel moved to recommend that the State Historic Preservation Office place the **DREXEL HOUSE** on the Arizona Register of Historic Places under **CRITERION C** at the **LOCAL** level of significance and that the nomination be forwarded to the Keeper of the National Register for placement in the National Register. The motion was seconded by Brooks Jeffery.

After discussion, the following recommendations that were agreed upon by the Committee:

- Revise name to “Drexel House” in accordance guidelines for naming properties.
- Revise period of significance to year of construction (1937).
- While the house is classified as Regional Eclectic, per the MPDF, it should be further described as on the spectrum close to a purer form of Pueblo Revival.

The chair called for a vote on the motion and it was passed unanimously (7-0). - (PT 2 – 35:28)

3. **DELISTING OF NATIONAL REGISTER PROPERTIES**

a. **226 N VIRGINIA St, Prescott, Yavapai County, Arizona** - (PT 2 – 35:50)

Located in the Whipple Heights Historic District, which had been altered without notification. The City of Prescott initiated request to delist the property due to lack of integrity.

Bill Collins provided an overview of the property at 226 North Virginia Street.

MOTION: (PT 2 – 48:53)

Brooks Jeffery moved to recommend that the State Historic Preservation Office delist the **226 NORTH VIRGINIA STREET** from the Arizona Register of Historic Places and the National Register of Historic Places. The motion was seconded by John Southard.

The chair called for a vote on the motion and was passed unanimously (7-0). - (PT 2 - 49:22)

D. **DISCUSSION OF HSRC SESSION AT HISTORIC PRESERVATION CONFERENCE** (PT 2 – 49:38)

The Committee discussed with the SHPO ideas on possible sessions that would be lead by HSRC as part of the 2017 Arizona Historic Preservation Conference.

E. **OLD BUSINESS**

1. **APPROVAL OF MINUTES FROM NOVEMBER 4, 2016 HSRC MEETING** - (PT 2 - 01:16:20)

MOTION TO OPEN DISCUSSION: (PT 2 – 1:16:30)

The Chair called for a motion to accept the minutes with (typo) revisions, Doug Kupel made the motion, which was seconded by John Lacy.

The chair called for a vote on the motion and it was passed unanimously (7-0). - (PT 2 – 1:17:12)

F. **STAFF REPORTS** - (PT 2 - 01:17:50)

1. **SHPO REPORTS**

- National Register Update** - Bill Collins reported that four Joesler properties were listed (Brown House, Woollen House, Andersen House, and Spec House 265), in addition to the Executive Towers in Phoenix, and the Mountain View Officers Club at Fort Huachuca. The Painted Desert Complex was also listed as a National Landmark. The Keeper returned the Peoria High School and the Downtown Tucson Commercial Historic District nominations.
- SHPO Staffing and Program News** - Kathryn Leonard reported Bob Frankeberger has retired, which leaves SHPO without a tax architect. The tax portions of his job are being covered by Eric Vondy, and the 106 portion is being covered by Kathryn with the assistance of the State Parks’

architect, Margy Parisella. There are plans in place to have Margy move over to SHPO to replace Bob, once Parks has hired, and trained replacement staff.

We have a new intern, Amy Hootman who is a dual major in anthropology and history.

The Arizona Site Steward program will once be again under SHPO. They will be interviewing applicants at the end of the month, and the position will be 50% Site Stewart, 50% State Parks archaeologist.

SHPO has expressed it's intent to divorce itself from the Arizona Main Street Program, which unfortunately has no funding attached to it, but has a substantial cost associated to. Follow models from other state that use 501c's, SHPO is working with APF, Arizona Downtown Alliance with assistance from Local First Arizona and Rural Development Council as a possible consortium to make a viable and sustainable organization.

Wrapping up Archaeological Awareness month in March and the Archaeology EXPO held in Tapawa, which was a great success.

- c. **Review and Compliance** - Kathryn Leonard reported that SHPO is working with other State Agencies to develop MOUs to clarify best practices and procedures and to promote better collaborations between agencies. Very close to executing the programmatic agreement with NRCS to address issues with grants to the ranching community.

The State Fair had issued a request for information for redevelopment of the State Fairgrounds.

- d. **Survey and Inventory** - Nothing reported.

- e. **Grants** - Eric Vondy reported that SHPO has the ability to access a portion of the FY17 funds, but the rest has not been approved, and are expecting CLG grants to be the same as last year, approximately \$85k.

- f. **Legislative Issues** - Kathryn Leonard report The Governor's Archaeological Advisory Commission (GAAC) had their sunset review and were reauthorized for a further three years, but awaiting the Governor's signature. The bill to dissolve many of the State boards has had the Arizona State Parks Board struck from the bill.

Local group interested in a companion State Tax program to leverage the Federal Tax Credit.

- g. **HP 2017 Conference** – Eric Vondy reported that planning for the 2017 conference is well underway and registration is currently at 140 people. Speakers include Ted Monoson from NCSHPO, and Kristine Firethunder from the Governor's Office of Tribal Relations. There will also be several pre-conference workshops include an adobe workshop, and a workshop on the new Government 2 Government Tribal Toolkit.

F. PUBLIC COMMENT: (PT 2 – 1:45:34)

None

G. AGENDA ITEMS: (PT 2 – 1:45:44)

Review of the HSRC

H. DATES FOR UPCOMING HSRC MEETINGS: (PT 2 - 1:45:20)

The following dates have been proposed for meetings in the 2017.

July 21, 2017 - November 3rd, 2017

I. ADJOURNED: (PT 2 – 1:46:45)

The Chair called the meeting adjourned at 1:44 PM.