

**HISTORIC SITES REVIEW COMMITTEE MINUTES  
ARIZONA STATE PARKS  
1300 West Washington Street, Phoenix, Arizona  
November 13, 2015**

**A. CALL TO ORDER PUBLIC SESSION**

1. Chair Terry Majewski called the meeting to order at 9:34 AM

**B. ROLL CALL / INTRODUCTION OF MEMBERS AND STAFF**

**1. HSRC Committee Members Present**

- a. John Jacquemart
- b. John Lacy
- c. Don Ryden, Vice Chair
- d. Doug Kupel
- e. Kathryn Leonard
- f. Brooks Jeffery
- g. Terry Majewski, Chair
- h. Jan Balsom
- i. Winston Thorne

**SHPO Staff Members Present**

- a. Jim Garrison
- b. Alyssa Gerszewski
- c. William Collins
- d. Vivia Strang
- e. Eric Vondy
- f. Bob Frankeberger

**C. NEW BUSINESS**

**1. NATIONAL REGISTER NOMINATIONS**

- a. Jorgine Boomer House, Phoenix, Maricopa, Arizona

**Strang** provided overview of Boomer House

Motion: **Jeffrey** moved that the State Historic Preservation Officer place the **Jorgine Boomer House** on the Arizona Register of Historic Places under Criterion "**C**" at the **state level** of significance and recommended that the nomination be forwarded to the Keeper of the National Register for listing in the National Register of Historic Places. Motion seconded: **Leonard**.

**Discussion:**

- Replace cement with concrete in the nomination when referring to building materials.
- Is the carpet original to the house? Include a statement about the original flooring.
- Clarify statement about “true architecture” in period 4, paragraph 2. Is this house Usonian?
- To improve case for significance, elaborate on how this building makes a visitor feel.
- Include a discussion of the house’s layout on a grid of equilateral triangles. Compare and contrast this with the square form of the Adelman House and the circular design of David and Gladys Wright House.
- Include a description on the use of desert masonry.
- Red wood is not a local material. Call it local masonry material instead.
- Section 7, page 8, clarify and elaborate on chronology of interior alterations.
- Docket and page number should be cited as Maricopa County Recorder rather than City of Phoenix on page 25.
- It was the consensus of the committee to nominate the Boomer House at the state level of significance. Jeffrey and Leonard amended motion to reflect the consensus.
- SHPO staff will take state level recommendation under consideration and guide the preparer.

**CLG Comments:**



STAFF REPORT

*Approved per  
staff  
recommendation  
10/19/15  
K*

To: City of Phoenix Historic Preservation Commission  
From: Kevin Weight, Planner III  
Subject: National Register Nomination for Jorgine Boomer House, 5808 N. 30th St.

This report requests that the Historic Preservation Commission (HPC) forward a recommendation to the Arizona Historic Sites Review Committee (HSRC) that the attached National Register of Historic Places (NRHP) registration form be approved.

THE ISSUE

On September 15, 2015, the City of Phoenix Historic Preservation Office received a National Register nomination for the Jorgine Boomer House at 5808 N. 30<sup>th</sup> Street. The nomination was prepared by Heritage Consulting Group at the request of the City of Phoenix. The HPC is required to review the nomination pursuant to the Phoenix Certified Local Government (CLG) Agreement. Under this agreement, the HPC is required to make a recommendation to the HSRC regarding the following:

- a) Whether the subject property is eligible for the National Register;
- b) Whether the documentation is accurate; and
- c) Whether the documentation is complete.

The HSRC will review these nominations at its next meeting on November 13, 2015 and has requested that the HPC provide its recommendation prior to the meeting.

This property is not currently listed on the Phoenix Historic Property Register.

DISCUSSION

Staff has previously provided comments and edits, which have been incorporated into this version of the nomination. Therefore, staff finds that the documentation is accurate and complete. Staff also concurs that the subject property is eligible for listing on the NRHP.

RECOMMENDATION

Staff requests that the HPC recommend that the attached NRHP registration form be forwarded to the HSRC for approval as submitted.

Attachment: HRSC November 13, 2015 Meeting Agenda  
NRHP Registration Form

**Majewski:** Called for the vote.  
Motion Carried.

b. Fred Hilvert House, Phoenix, Maricopa, Arizona

**Strang** provided overview of Fred Hilvert House

Motion: **Balsom** moved that the State Historic Preservation Officer place the **Fred Hilvert House** on the Arizona Register of Historic Places under Criterion "**C**" at the **local level** of significance and recommended that the nomination be forwarded to the Keeper of the National Register for listing in the National Register of Historic Places. Motion seconded: **Jaquemart**.

**Discussion:**

- Include a clearer statement of integrity. Clarify what is original and what has been changed. How do the architectural features support the integrity and the alterations undermine the integrity?
- Period of significance should just be 1929.
- Include Fitzhugh and Byron plans in the nomination.
- Use different colors to indicate modifications to the house on the plans.
- Include an arrow to indicate the house on aerial site plan.
- Provide more background on Hilvert and his business.
- How does this house compare to others in Country Club?
- The committee made a consensus with the help of Jim Garrison and asked for the preparer to place the house in the context of Fitzhugh and Byron's other residential work in Phoenix.

**CLG Comments:**



**STAFF REPORT**

*Approved per staff  
recommendation  
10/14/15*

*(Commissioner Leonard requested  
classification of record for  
50-year cutoff for  
Criterion A significance -  
related to continuous  
use as market  
through 1965)*

To: City of Phoenix Historic Preservation Commission  
From: Erika Finbraaten, MA, AICP  
Historic Preservation Planner / Planner II  
Subject: Two Nominations to the National Register of Historic Places

*J*

This report requests that the Historic Preservation Commission forward a recommendation to the Arizona Historic Sites Review Committee (HSRC) that the attached National Register of Historic Places registration forms be approved subject to the revisions noted by staff.

THE ISSUE

In September 2015, the City of Phoenix Historic Preservation (HP) Office received National Register of Historic Places registration forms for the following properties:

1. Hilvert, Fred G., House, 106 East Country Club Road
2. Welnick Arcade Market and Liefgreen Seed Company Building, 341-345 West Van Buren Street

Pursuant to the City's Certified Local Government (CLG) Agreement with the Arizona State Historic Preservation Office (SHPO), the City of Phoenix HP Commission is required to make a recommendation to the Arizona Historic Sites Review Committee (HSRC) regarding the following:

- a) Whether the subject property is eligible for the National Register;
- b) Whether the documentation is accurate; and
- c) Whether the documentation is complete.

The HSRC will review these nominations at its next meeting on Friday, November 13, 2015, and has requested that the HP Commission provide its recommendation prior to the meeting.

The Fred G. Hilvert House is located in the Phoenix Country Club. It is not listed on the Phoenix Historic Property Register. The Welnick Arcade Market and Liefgreen Seed

Company Building is in the process of being designated to the Phoenix Historic Property Register and is on today's agenda.

DISCUSSION

After reviewing the nominations, staff concurs that both properties are eligible for listing on the National Register of Historic Places. Staff also finds that the documentation is accurate and complete, subject to the comments and edits that are noted on each form.

RECOMMENDATION

Staff requests that the Historic Preservation Commission recommend that the attached National Register of Historic Places registration forms be forwarded to the Arizona Historic Sites Review Committee for approval subject to the comments and edits noted on the forms.

Attachment: National Register of Historic Places Registration Forms (2)

**Majewski:** Called for the vote.  
Motion Carried.

c. Welnick Arcade Market and Liefgreen Seed Company Building, Phoenix, Maricopa Arizona

**Strang** provided overview of Welnick Market and Liefgreen Building

Motion: **Lacy** moved that the State Historic Preservation Officer place the **Welnick Arcade Market and Liefgreen Seed Company Building** on the Arizona Register of Historic Places under Criterion “ **A** ” at the **local level** of significance and recommended that the nomination be forwarded to the Keeper of the National Register for listing in the National Register of Historic Places. Motioned seconded: **Jeffery**.

**Discussion:**

- Revise and clarify summary statement of significance in Section 8. Make sure the statement reflects the narrative. Mention grocery history in summary paragraph.
- Include better photos of the façade of the East building. Clarify the original floor plan and the alterations.
- The committee and staff came to a consensus that since they were constructed simultaneously, these two buildings should be included in one nomination.
- Building 3 was demolished. Make sure the site plan reflects this information.
- Bob Frankeberger, SHPO architect, states that the building does not express the development of Phoenix, and should not be nominated under Criterion A. He is supportive of Criterion C for architecture and building type. It expresses the work of Fitzhugh and Byron. There are currently integrity issues with Criterion C. The Liefgreen building is not eligible under C until the sheathing is removed. When the sheathing is removed, there will be sufficient evidence to recreate it accurately.
- The committee feels that commercial development is expressed in the building typology, which falls under Criterion A.
- Garrison states that the sheathing on the Liefgreen building needs to be removed before listing.
- By the end of the discussion, the committee came to a consensus and advised using Criterion A only. It’s current state, given the sheathing, Criterion A is the recommended approach. If the sheathing is removed, the nomination could be revised to include Criterion C at a later date. Lacy and Jeffrey amended motion to reflect the consensus.

**CLG Comments:** Included above with Fred Hilvert House comments.

**Majewski:** Called for the vote.  
Motion Carried.



## **2. Joesler Work Session: The Residential Architecture of Josias T. Joesler and John and Helen Murphey in Tucson, Pima County, Arizona, 1927-1956**

Revised Section F.

- Paula Scott incorporated comments from July HSRC meeting and revised Section F.
- Vivia Strang visited the Keeper's office in Washington, DC in early November and spoke to Lisa Deline about the revised Section F. Deline supports the document.
- Bill Collins, Janet Parkhurst, and Linda Weed finished editing Section E.
- Jim Garrison stated that SHPO is relying on Lisa Deline's direction regarding the MPDF. Deline supports using Criterion A and C and keeping John and Helen Murphey in the MPDF.
- Bill Collins stated that buildings Joesler designed without Murphey will be nominated individually. The MPDF only serves to help nominate Joesler-Murphey properties.
- The MPDF could be used as a reference document for nominating independent Joesler properties.
- List of properties in Section F need to be verified to ensure they're all Joesler-Murphey.
- By the end of the discussion, the committee and staff came to a consensus to follow Lisa Deline's recommendation.

Motion: **Jeffrey** moved that the Historic Sites Review Committee approve the MPDF titled the **Residential Architecture of Josias T. Joesler and John and Helen Murphey in Tucson, Pima County, Arizona, 1927-1956**, including revised Section E and F, and recommended that the document be forwarded to the Keeper of the National Register for listing in the National Register of Historic Places. Motioned seconded: **Lacy**.

**Majewski:** Called for a vote.  
Motion Carried.

### **D. OLD BUSINESS**

#### **1. APPROVAL OF MINUTES FROM JULY 24, 2015 HSRC MEETING**

**Majewski:** Called for a vote.  
Motion Carried.

### **E. STAFF REPORTS**

#### **1. SHPO REPORTS**

- a. **National Register Update – Strang:** 18 Joesler properties in the queue. Date Palm Manor and Tomlinson Estates have been submitted to the Keeper. The Luhrs Tower and Luhrs Building have not been revised or submitted yet.
- b. **SHPO Staffing and Program News – Garrison:** Discusses State Parks move to new location in North Phoenix. SHPO staff is moving to Evans House. All 3 interns found new employment.
- c. **Review and Compliance – Garrison:** Provides Amity Pueblo update.
- d. **Survey and Inventory –** None at this time.

- e. **Grants – Garrison:** Provides update on reauthorization of Historic Preservation Fund.
- f. **Legislative Issues** – None at this time.
- g. **HP 2016 Conference – Vondy:** Discusses dates, location, featured speakers, and proposed sessions.
- h. **HSRC Membership** – None at this time.

**F. PUBLIC COMMENT:** None.

**G. AGENDA ITEMS:** None.

**H. DATES FOR UPCOMING HSRC MEETINGS:** March 25, 2016, July 22, 2016,  
November 4, 2016

**I. ADJOURNED:** 12:20 P.M.