

HISTORIC SITES REVIEW COMMITTEE (HSRC)

**1110 West Washington Street, Suite 250,
Phoenix, Arizona
Friday, November 3, 2017**

A. CALL TO ORDER PUBLIC SESSION / AND ROLL CALL

1. Chair Terry Majewski called the meeting to order at 9:36 AM

B. INTRODUCTION OF MEMBERS AND STAFF - (00:40)

ROLL CALL

In lieu of roll call the Chair asked the staff to introduce themselves

HSRC Committee Members Present

Terry Majewski, Chair
Don Ryden, Vice Chair
John Jacquemart
Doug Kupel
Jan Balsom
Brooks Jeffery
John Lacy
John Southard

HSRC Committee Members Absent

None

SHPO Staff Members Present

Kathryn Leonard
William (Bill) Collins
Eric Vondy
Joe Roth
Margy Parisella

Guests

Donna Reiner, Consultant
Jen Levstick, Consultant
Kim Steadman, City of Mesa
Lauren Allsopp, City of Mesa
Allison Deihl, City of Tucson
Tom Klobas, Arizona Railway Museum (TCBG Caboose)
Kristine Soleri Timm, (Dome House)
Tom Swann, Homeowner (Ponderosa II)
John Becker, Homeowner (Borah House)
Peter Larsen, Resident (Ferguson House)

C. NEW BUSINESS

1. RETURNING NATIONAL REGISTER NOMINATIONS

a. DOME HOUSE, Cave Creek, Maricopa County, Arizona - (02:29)

Bill Collins provided an overview of the Dome House nomination.

Kristine Soleri Timm (architect's daughter) to address Committee questions.

MOTION TO OPEN DISCUSSION: (04:29)

Jan Balsom moved to recommend that the State Historic Preservation Officer place the **DOME HOUSE** on the Arizona Register of Historic Places under **CRITERION C** at the **LOCAL** level of significance and that the nomination be forwarded to the Keeper of the National Register for placement in the National Register. The motion was seconded by Jon Lacy.

After open discussion, the following recommendations were made by the Committee:

- Work with staff to support C nomination as work of Master Architect Soleri, with assistance from Mills
- Trim down much of the distracting context Modernism / Post-War Architecture and “desert living”
- Address SHPO Architect Comments

The Chair called for a vote on the original motion, which passed unanimously with a vote of 8-0. - (27:00)

b. PONDEROSA II, Mesa, Maricopa County, Arizona - (28:05)

Bill Collins provided an overview of the Ponderosa II nomination.

Tom Swann (homeowner) was present to address Committee questions.

MOTION TO OPEN DISCUSSION: (30:20)

Brooks Jeffery moved to recommend that the State Historic Preservation Officer place the **PONDEROSA II** on the Arizona Register of Historic Places under **CRITERIA A** at the **LOCAL** level of significance and that the nomination be forwarded to the Keeper of the National Register for placement in the National Register. The motion was seconded by John Southard.

After open discussion, the following recommendations were made by the Committee:

- Change Period of Significance to a single date, 1963.
- Figure 12 needs to be added (missing).
- Change character style from “Cowboy Character Ranch” to simply “Ranch.”
- Adjust narrative on area of significance to focus on community planning and development, not style,
- Improve marketing context and include such examples as “Dutchtown,” “Cinderella Heights,” “Sun City” and other marketing concept developments.
- Address SHPO Architect Comments

The Chair called for a vote on the original motion, which passed unanimously with a vote of 8-0. - (01:01:27)

2. NEW NATIONAL REGISTER NOMINATIONS

a. FERGUSON HOUSE, Tucson Vicinity, Pima County, Arizona - (01:02:32)

Bill Collins provided an overview of the Ferguson House nomination.

Peter Larsen (resident) was present to address Committee questions.

MOTION TO OPEN DISCUSSION: (01:04:15)

Brooks Jeffrey moved to recommend that the State Historic Preservation Officer place the **FERGUSON HOUSE COMMERCIAL HISTORIC DISTRICT** on the Arizona Register of Historic Places under **CRITERION C** at the **LOCAL** level of significance and that the nomination be forwarded to the Keeper of the National Register for placement in the National Register. The motion was seconded by John Lacy.

After open discussion, the following recommendations were made by the Committee:

- General edits per HSRC comments.
- Change Period of Significance to be based on Josler's design, 1936 or 1936-1937.
- Citation for historic photos.
- Floorplan showing additions with dates of construction.
- Address SHPO Architect Comments.

The Chair called for a vote on the original motion, which passed unanimously with a vote of 8-0. - (01:33:40)

Consultant to be instructed to work with SHPO to integrate changes, and submit to Keeper of the National Register, or return to Committee, if SHPO deems necessary.

b. JOHNSON HOUSE, Tucson Vicinity, Pima County, Arizona - (01:33:55)

Bill Collins provided an overview of the Johnson House nomination.

Owner was not present to address Committee questions.

MOTION TO OPEN DISCUSSION: (01:36:10)

Jan Balsom moved to recommend that the State Historic Preservation Officer place the **JOHNSON HOUSE** on the Arizona Register of Historic Places under **CRITERIA C** at the **LOCAL** level of significance and that the nomination be forwarded to the Keeper of the National Register for placement in the National Register. The motion was seconded by John Jacquemart.

After open discussion, the following recommendations were made by the Committee:

- General edits per HSRC comments.
- Remove unnecessary context on Colleen Coyle Matthis.
- Clearly define period of significance with narrative.
- Address SHPO Architect Comments.

The Chair called for a vote on the original motion, which passed unanimously with a vote of 8-0. - (01:40:44)

Consultant instructed to work with SHPO to integrate Committee comments, and submission to Keeper of the National Register.

c. CATALINA FOOTHILLS ESTATES JOB #399 HOUSE, Tucson Vicinity, Pima County, Arizona - (01:40:54)

Bill Collins provided an overview of the Congdon House nomination.

MOTION TO OPEN DISCUSSION: (01:43:08)

Jan Balsom moved to recommend that the State Historic Preservation Officer place the **CATALINA FOOTHILLS ESTATES JOB #399 HOUSE** on the Arizona Register of Historic Places under **CRITERIA C** at the **LOCAL** level of significance and that the nomination be forwarded to the Keeper of the National Register for placement in the National Register. The motion was seconded by Doug Kupel.

After open discussion, the following recommendations were made by the Committee:

- General edits per HSRC comments.
- Removal references to “zonal design” and “Mexican kitchen.”
- Cleaning up text which refers to Goodman house.
- Lack of verbal boundary description.
- Fails to make adequate case of integrity with respect to additions, recommend addition of a photo key map, additional photos (including historic photos), and floor plans detailing additions and dates of construction.
- Included photos do not adequately convey integrity,
- Removal of extraneous text (i.e. harmonious / compatible)
- Address SHPO Architect Comments.

The Chair called for a vote on the original motion, which was **DENIED** unanimously with a vote of 8-0. - (02:04:37)

Consultant instructed to work with SHPO to integrate Committee comments, and resubmit to Committee for review.

(BREAK - PART 2)

d. WOODROW HOUSE, Tucson, Pima County, Arizona - (00:05)

Bill Collins provided an overview of the Woodrow House nomination.

Jen Levstick (consultant) was present to address Committee questions.

MOTION TO OPEN DISCUSSION: (02:06)

Brooks Jeffery moved to recommend that the State Historic Preservation Officer place the **BEADLE HOUSE #11** on the Arizona Register of Historic Places under **CRITERIA C** at the **LOCAL** level of significance and that the nomination be forwarded to the Keeper of the National Register for placement in the National Register. The motion was seconded by John Lacy.

After open discussion, the following recommendations were made by the Committee:

- General edits per HSRC comments.
- Edit narrative to reflect more on Brown and this property as the work of a Master Architect, with less emphasis on modernist style and post-war subdivision development.
- Eliminate use of the term “Functional Floorplan.”
- Replace the term “streamline” with “utilitarian.”
- Remove 1975 as a significant date (outside period of significance).
- Simplification of boundary description, and remove reference to additional parcel.
- More details of unique cooling/heating system.
- Correct un-matching figures and corresponding text.

- Building is mortar-washed burnt adobe, not mud adobe covered in plaster.
- Clarify to indicate double-hung windows replaced the original casement windows.
- Address SHPO Architect Comments.

The Chair called for a vote on the original motion, which passed unanimously with a vote of 8-0. - (30:45)

Consultant instructed to work with SHPO to integrate Committee comments, and submission to Keeper of the National Register.

e. BORAH HOUSE, Phoenix, Maricopa County, Arizona - (31:01)

Bill Collins provided an overview of the Borah House nomination.

John Becker (homeowner) was present to address Committee questions.

MOTION TO OPEN DISCUSSION: (33:20)

Don Ryden moved to recommend that the State Historic Preservation Officer place the **BORAH HOUSE** on the Arizona Register of Historic Places under **CRITERION A** at the **LOCAL** level of significance and that the nomination be forwarded to the Keeper of the National Register for placement in the National Register. The motion was seconded by John Southard.

After open discussion, the following recommendations were made by the Committee:

- General edits per HSRC comments.
- General edits per City of Phoenix comments.
- Change to “Mediterranean” style.
- Improve discussion on integrity.
- Floors are “concrete,” not “cement.”
- Add additional Lescher & Mahoney information (Jacquemart / Reiner)
- Include floor plan with additions, dates of constructions.
- Clarification of contributing and non-contributing elements.
- Include reference to three other Lescher & Mahoney buildings in Country Club District.
- Simplification of boundary description.
- Address SHPO Architect Comments.

The Chair called for a vote on the original motion, which passed unanimously with a vote of 8-0. - (51:59)

Consultant instructed to work with SHPO to integrate Committee comments, and submission to Keeper of the National Register.

D. OLD BUSINESS: (52:15)

1. DISCUSSION OF NRHP NOMINATION RETURNED BY KEEPER OF THE NATIONAL REGISTER

a. TUCSON, CORNELIA AND GILA BEND RAILROAD CABOOSE #15, Chandler, Maricopa County, Arizona - (52:26)

Bill Collins reported that the Tucson, Cornelia and Gila Bend Railroad Caboose #15 nomination was

returned by the National Register, with comments for revision. Included guidelines for reworking nomination under C, for engineering, but could still be under criteria A but would require extensive revisions and supporting documentation.

Tom Klobas, who was present to address Committee questions, submitted a revised nomination in response to comments from the Keeper's office, but too late to present to the Committee.

Committee suggested to rework the nomination to emphasize the uniqueness / rarity of the cabooses, in comparison to "normal" cabooses.

Consultant instructed to work with SHPO to integrate Committee comments, and submission to Keeper of the National Register.

b. LIBERTY UNITED METHODIST CHURCH, Buckeye, Maricopa County, Arizona -

(1:08:33)

Bill Collins reported that the Liberty United Methodist Church nomination was returned by the National Register, with comments for revision. The Keeper's office indicated that the nomination, which was originally submitted under criteria A & C, did not have sufficient support for criteria A, and the nomination should be revised / re-edited to support listing under only criteria C.

Consultant instructed to work with SHPO to integrate Committee comments, and submission to Keeper of the National Register.

2. APPROVAL OF MINUTES FROM JULY 21st, 2017 HSRC MEETING: - (01:16:51)

MOTION: The Chair called for a motion to accept the minutes, John Lacy made the motion, which was seconded by Don Ryden. - (01:17:01)

Proposed Changes:

- Under A-2, Election of Chair and Vice Chair, 2nd motion, change "roll" to "role"
- Under Section B, Guests, Change "Jonathan" to "Jonathan Mabry"

The chair called for a vote on the motion, with revisions, and it was passed unanimously (8-0). - (01:18:01)

E. STAFF REPORTS - (01:18:31)

1. SHPO REPORTS

a. SHPO National Register Update -

Bill Collins reported that since the last march HSRC meeting, approved listing include; the Pemberton House, the Bauder House, the Fourth Avenue Commercial Historic District, and updates (one house each) to the F.Q. Story and El Encanto Estates Districts. Also listed was the Salt River Project, Arizona: A Federal Reclamation Project MPDF, which lists SRP's dams and canal system throughout Arizona. Two nominations were returned, Including the TCG Caboose and the Liberty Church. There are three pending nominations, the Beadle House #11, and amendments to the Encanto-Palmcroft and the Barrio El Hoyo Districts. The revised Miracle Mile nomination was just sent off.

b. SHPO Staffing and Program News -

Kathryn Leonard report that the office is looking into options for additional funding for SHPO, including a cost-sharing positions with other state agencies. SHPO is looking into the feasibility of charging a fee for applying/participation for the tax reduction program.

Eric Vondy and Margy Parisella are working on setting-up a charrette for planning the future of the State Fairgrounds.

SHPO is assisting Arizona State Parks with the possible acquisition (through donation) of the historic ranch and surrounding property, north of Anthem, for use as a future State Park.

Looking into options/procedures for the use of CLG funds which are returned to SHPO due to dropped, or cancelled projects, and using them for other shovel-ready projects.

c. Review and Compliance -

Kathryn Leonard reported that SHPO has recently signed a programmatic agreement with NRCS and ASLD which covers conservation projects to streamline the federal and state reviews for conservation grants, as one streamlined process. The agreement is nationwide example of streamlining the state and federal processes. The next step is to expand the PA to include all of the land conservation agencies in one over-compassing agreement.

d. Survey and Inventory -

Kathryn Leonard reported about the controversy that has arisen regarding the Chinese Cultural Center, whose new owner announced his intention to remove all the Chinese ornamentation to convert it to a generic office building.

In Scottsdale, there is a proposal to use school bond funding to demolish the Hopi School, and two other mid-century modern schools in the future. SHPO was asked to make a determination of eligibility for the school, that they deemed eligible and suggested the development of a context.

e. Grants -

Kathryn Leonard report that SHPO was approached by the National Trust a group of non-profit organizations to help secure funding for the adaptive reuse of the Mountain View Officer's Club in Fort Huachuca. The SHPO office staff prepared and submitted an application for a \$500,000 Civil Rights grant from NPS on their behalf.

Eric Vondy reported that SHPO has finally received their federal funding for the last fiscal year fiscal year.

surveys, for which they are encouraging partnership with the bordering National Parks.

f. Legislative Issues -

Kathryn Leonard report that the House Republican's tax plan does not include provisions for the federal rehabilitation tax credits, which puts the entire program at risk.

g. HP 2017 Conference –

Eric Vondy reported that the 2018 conference is scheduled for June 6th-8th at the Valley Ho in Scottsdale. The theme of the conference is "Design in the Desert," which encompasses both architecture and archaeology, with an emphasis on midcentury modern. David Brown, from the National Trust, has tentatively agreed to be a keynote speaker. We have already had a handful of sessions have already been submitted, including participation by Taliesin West.

Committee members discussed, and agreed to participate and present HSRC themed sessions.

F. PUBLIC COMMENT: - (01:50:30)

No Additional

G. SETTING 2018 HISTORIC SITES REVIEW COMMITTEE MEETINGS: - (1:50:40)

The following dates have been proposed for meetings in the 2018.

March 2nd, 2018 - July 27th, 2018 - November 2nd, 2018

H. AGENDA ITEMS:

No Additional

I. DATES FOR 2017 HSRC MEETINGS:

March 24th, 2017 - July 21st, 2017 - November 3rd, 2017

J. ADJOURNED: (01:58:00)

The Chair called the meeting adjourned at 1:57 PM

Minutes prepared by: Joseph Roth, State Historic Preservation Office
and was posted on Wednesday, November 8th, 2017

Minutes are considered draft until official approved by a quorum of the Committee at the next scheduled meeting