

**HISTORIC SITES REVIEW COMMITTEE (HSRC)**

**1110 West Washington Street, Suite 250,  
Phoenix, Arizona  
Friday, July 27th, 2018**

**A. CALL TO ORDER PUBLIC SESSION / AND ROLL CALL**

- 1. Chair Terry Majewski called the meeting to order at 9:31 AM**

**B. INTRODUCTION OF MEMBERS AND STAFF** - (00:16)

**ROLL CALL**

In lieu of roll call the Chair asked the staff to introduce themselves

**HSRC Committee Members Present**

Terry Majewski, Chair  
Don Ryden, Vice Chair (arrived 9:35 am)  
Brooks Jeffery (via teleconference)  
John Jacquemart  
Doug Kupel  
John Southard  
Karl Eberhard

**HSRC Committee Members Absent**

Jan Balsom

**SHPO Staff Members Present**

Kathryn Leonard  
William (Bill) Collins  
Eric Vondy  
Joe Roth  
Theresa Cano

**Guests**

Bob Graham, Consultant  
Michelle Dodds, City of Phoenix

**C. NEW BUSINESS**

**1. NEW NATIONAL REGISTER NOMINATIONS**

- a. FLYING ACES HISTORIC DISTRICT, Phoenix, Maricopa County, Arizona** - (01:42)

Bill Collins provided an overview of the Flying Aces Historic District nomination.

**MOTION TO OPEN DISCUSSION:** (02:54)

Doug Kupel moved to recommend that the State Historic Preservation Officer place the **FLYING ACES HISTORIC DISTRICT** on the Arizona Register of Historic Places under **CRITERION A & C** at the **LOCAL** level of significance and that the nomination be forwarded to the Keeper of the

National Register for placement in the National Register. The motion was seconded by John Southard.

Ken Stedman was present to address questions, if necessary.

After open discussion, the following recommendations were made by the Committee:

- Additional research required to support the criteria A nomination
- Questions of pre-existing buildings within the district
- Suggest the integrity discussion include discussion of sidewalks since the period of significance runs up to 1957, and the sidewalks were not in district in 1963.
- Address changing of street names
- Address connection of subdivision and relation to aeronautic development in Mesa
- Adjust period of significance to platted years
- Address SHPO, CLG, and Commission Comments

**REVISED MOTION:** Doug Kupel revised his motion to table the nomination until such time as it can be revised per on the discussions of this meeting. The seconder, John Southard concurred which PASSED unanimously with a vote of 7-0. - (23:25)

Consultant should revise nomination per comments and resubmit to Commission for review.

**b. ROMAN ROADS, Phoenix, Maricopa County, Arizona - (24:35)**

Bill Collins provided an overview of the Roman Roads nomination.

Catherine Curry (consultant) was present to address Committee questions.

**MOTION TO OPEN DISCUSSION:** (26:12)

John Southard moved to recommend that the State Historic Preservation Officer place the **ROMAN ROADS** on the Arizona Register of Historic Places under **CRITERIA C** at the **LOCAL** level of significance and that the nomination be forwarded to the Keeper of the National Register for placement in the National Register. The motion was seconded by John Jacquemart.

After open discussion, the following recommendations were made by the Committee:

- Suggested removing the term “methian” under style
- Suggest on page 22, replace reference to “15 years ago” with actual year
- Suggest on page 25, change “is eligible for Criterion C” rather than “meets”
- Suggest on page 26, in the header remove “An introduction to” and leave “Al Beadle”
- Suggest on page 26, move Doug Ducey quote to later in narrative, since he is not an architectural historian, and could confuse reviewers
- Under integrity discussion, please add information regarding carports being turned to garages
- Suggest additional information about Buckley
- Address SHPO and CLG Comments

The Chair called for a vote on the original motion, which passed unanimously with a vote of 7-0. - (47:50)

Consultant should revise nomination per comments and submit to SHPO for submission to the Keeper.

c. **DUD R. DAY MOTOR COMPANY-PHOENIX MOTOR COMPANY, Phoenix, Maricopa County, Arizona** - (48:15)

Bill Collins provided an overview of the Dud R. Day Motor Company-Phoenix Motor Company nomination.

Vince Murray (Consultant) was present to address questions

**MOTION TO OPEN DISCUSSION:** (49:40)

John Southard moved to recommend that the State Historic Preservation Officer place the **DUD R. DAY MOTOR COMPANY-PHOENIX MOTOR COMPANY** on the Arizona Register of Historic Places under **CRITERIA A** at the **LOCAL** level of significance and that the nomination be forwarded to the Keeper of the National Register for placement in the National Register. The motion was seconded by Karl Eberhard.

After open discussion, the following recommendations were made by the Committee:

- Section 7-8, Page 5, Footnote on “Automobile Design Guidelines” should be move up one paragraph where first reference is made.
- Commission questioned the integrity of the building interior in regards to removal of a second floor mezzanine and offices.
- Suggest adding text referring to the interior “large open space”
- Change name to Phoenix Motor Company
- Adjust Building type for Original Building as Spanish Colonial Style, with the addition being “no style”
- Address SHPO and CLG Comments

The Chair called for a vote on the original motion, which passed unanimously with a vote of 7-0. - (01:08:45)

Consultant instructed to work with SHPO to integrate Committee, SHPO and CLG comments, then submit to Keeper.

d. **OUR LADY OF PERPETUAL HELP MISSION CHURCH, Phoenix, Maricopa County, Arizona** - (01:09:17)

Bill Collins provided an overview of the Our Lady of Perpetual Help Mission Church nomination.

**MOTION TO OPEN DISCUSSION:** (01:11:10)

Karl Eberhard moved to recommend that the State Historic Preservation Officer place the **OUR LADY OF PERPETUAL HELP MISSION CHURCH** on the Arizona Register of Historic Places under **CRITERIA C** at the **LOCAL** level of significance and that the nomination be forwarded to the Keeper of the National Register for placement in the National Register. The motion was seconded by Doug Kupel.

After open discussion, the following recommendations were made by the Committee:

- Section 7, Page 10, update figure to indicate it is from the assessor’s office
- Remove checkbox next to Criterion A
- Section 7, Page 7, In picture caption change term “open-air buttresses” to “flying buttresses” to be consistent with adjacent text
- Correct conflicting spelling of Grandyell Shumaker and possibly additional information on him
- Section 7, Page 13, add “P.E.” after Robert T. Evans

- Section 7, Page 14, under Statement of Significance Summary, correct and expand explanation in last sentence: “*The building meets Criteria Consideration A as a property previously used for religious purposes because of its architectural significance.*”
- Section 7, Page 9, in reference to All Saints Catholic Church, change “(not in existence)” to indicated building was demolished and the date, if possible.
- Address SHPO and CLG Comments

The Chair called for a vote on the original motion, which was passed by a vote of 7-0 - (01:23:30)

Consultant instructed to work with SHPO to integrate Committee, SHPO and CLG comments, then submit to Keeper.

e. **PAUL LAWRENCE DUNBAR SCHOOL, Tucson, Pima County, Arizona** - (01:24:35)

Bill Collins provided an overview of the Paul Lawrence Dunbar School nomination.

**MOTION TO OPEN DISCUSSION:** (01:26:27)

Doug Kupel moved to recommend that the State Historic Preservation Officer place the **PAUL LAWRENCE DUNBAR SCHOOL** on the Arizona Register of Historic Places under **CRITERIA A** at the **LOCAL** level of significance and that the nomination be forwarded to the Keeper of the National Register for placement in the National Register. The motion was seconded by John Southard.

After open discussion, the following recommendations were made by the Committee:

- Section 8, Page 4, under summary, 2<sup>nd</sup> paragraph, states “In 1988, a portion of the Dunbar School was listed as a contributing resource to the *John Spring Neighborhood Historic District*” but does not specify what portion/building was listed until Section 9, Page 25 in the paragraph prior to the conclusion.
- Specify in summary paragraph that there are actually two separate buildings which, at times, were connected by a breezeway.
- Section 8, Page 16, continue “temporal fashion” wording in 3<sup>rd</sup> paragraph which switched to an “architectural fashion.”
- Section 8, Page 16, Suggest removing from end of 2<sup>nd</sup> paragraph “*and where discrimination could be hidden behind scalloped parapets.*”
- Section 8, Page 16, reviewers found it confusing that the two sections are referred to as wings, rather than two separate buildings
- Suggest change in architectural styles was due to modernism movement rather than the connection to segregation.
- Address SHPO and CLG Comments

The Chair called for a vote on the original motion, which was passed by a vote of 7-0 - (01:51:25)

Consultant instructed to work with SHPO to integrate Committee, SHPO and CLG comments, then submit to Keeper.

f. **WEST UNIVERSITY HISTORIC DISTRICT BOUNDARY EXPANSION, Tucson, Pima County, Arizona** - (01:51:42)

Bill Collins provided an overview of the West University Historic District Boundary Expansion nomination.

**MOTION TO OPEN DISCUSSION:** (01:53:13)

Don Ryden moved to recommend that the State Historic Preservation Officer place the **WEST UNIVERSITY HISTORIC DISTRICT BOUNDARY EXPANSION** on the Arizona Register of Historic Places under **CRITERIA A & C** at the **LOCAL** level of significance and that the nomination be forwarded to the Keeper of the National Register for placement in the National Register. The motion was seconded by John Southard.

After open discussion, the following recommendations were made by the Committee:

- The building at 222 East 5<sup>th</sup> Street, although the building may possibly be individually eligible (with further research), it was not constructed within the period of significance for the district, and is therefore a non-contributor.
- Address SHPO and CLG Comments

The Chair called for a vote on the original motion, which was passed by a vote of 7-0 - (02:07:15)

Consultant instructed to work with SHPO to integrate Committee, SHPO and CLG comments, then submit to Keeper.

**g. STOUT'S HOTEL, Gila Bend, Maricopa County, Arizona - (02:07:30)**

Bill Collins provided an overview of the Stout's Hotel nomination.

**MOTION TO OPEN DISCUSSION: (02:09:22)**

Doug Kupel moved to recommend that the State Historic Preservation Officer place the **STOUT'S HOTEL** on the Arizona Register of Historic Places under **CRITERIA A** at the **STATE** level of significance and that the nomination be forwarded to the Keeper of the National Register for placement in the National Register. The motion was seconded by Doug Ryden.

After open discussion, the following recommendations were made by the Committee:

- Suggested combining ruinous building and southern half of the property as a non-contributing site
- Address SHPO and CLG Comments

**AMENDED MOTION: (02:24:53)**

Doug Kupel moved to amend his motion to list the property at the **LOCAL** level of significance. The seconder, Doug Ryden concurred with the amendment.

The Chair called for a vote on the AMENDED motion, which was passed by a vote of 7-0 - (02:27:28)

Consultant instructed to work with SHPO to integrate Committee, SHPO and CLG comments, then submit to Keeper.

**(NOTE: Don Ryden left the meeting)**

**2. RESUBMITTED NATIONAL REGISTER NOMINATIONS**

**a. CATALINA FOOTHILLS ESTATES JOB # 399 HOUSE, Tucson, Pima County, Arizona - (02:30:55)**

Janet Parkhurst (consultant) attended via teleconference to address questions

Bill Collins provided an overview of the proposed Catalina Foothills Estates Job # 399 House delisting.

**MOTION TO OPEN DISCUSSION:** (02:33:30)

John Southard moved to recommend that the State Historic Preservation Officer place the **CATALINA FOOTHILLS ESTATES JOB # 399 HOUSE** on the Arizona Register of Historic Places under **CRITERIA A** at the **LOCAL** level of significance and that the nomination be forwarded to the Keeper of the National Register for placement in the National Register. The motion was seconded by John Jacquemart.

After open discussion, the following recommendations were made by the Committee:

- Need to strengthen case of integrity with respect to additions, recommend addition of a photo key map, additional photos (including historic photos), and floor plans detailing additions and dates of construction.
- Question the Period of significance (which is currently 1940), sympathetic additions were added later, and their status is unclear.
- Information on designers / construction of additions
- Inconsistent dates for construction of the guest house / garage outbuilding
- Address SHPO and CLG Comments

The Chair called for a vote on the original motion, which passed unanimously with a vote of 7-0. - (02:59:58)

Consultant instructed to work with SHPO to integrate Committee, SHPO and CLG comments, then submit to Keeper.

**D. OLD BUSINESS:**

**1. APPROVAL OF MINUTES FROM MARCH 2<sup>nd</sup>, 2018 HSRC MEETING - (02:57:13)**

**MOTION:** The Chair called for a motion to accept the minutes, Karl Eberhard made the motion, which was seconded by John Jacquemart. - (02:57:13)

Proposed Changes:

- Doug Kupel suggested that the minutes had numerous errors and needed to be rewritten and resubmitted for the next meeting.

The chair called for a vote on the motion, and it was DENIED unanimously (0-7). - (02:59:07)

The minutes were tabled and would be revised and resubmitted at the next meeting for approval.

**E. STAFF REPORTS - (02:59:38)**

**1. SHPO REPORTS**

**a. SHPO National Register Update -**

Bill Collins reported that since the March 2, 2018 HSRC meeting Properties Listed in National Register include: OK Ranch Historic District, (Sedona vic.), Borah House (Phoenix), Dome House (Cave Creek), Tucson, Cornelia and Gila Bend Railroad Caboose #15 (Chandler), Woodrow House (Tucson), Ferguson House, (Tucson) and the Ponderosa II (Mesa).

There were reclassification of houses in various districts, including: Rincon Heights Historic District (1), Clarkdale Historic District (1), Windsor Square Historic District (4), Evergreen

Historic District (2), Silk Stocking Neighborhood Historic District (1), and Blenman-Elm Historic District (1).

Delisting of three properties, including: Blixt-Avitia House (Tucson), Fredley Apartments (Yuma), Fredley House (Yuma).

**b. SHPO Staffing and Program News -**

Kathryn Leonard report that they have a new employee, Theresa Cano, who is an Administrative Assistance who will supplement Joe's efforts and assist the entire staff.

They have also hired a new archaeologist, Erin Davis who is scheduled to start on Monday.

Kathryn Leonard report that they are currently in the process of hiring a new Deputy SHPO, which is a new position created following the retirement of Ann Howard. This position will address the current separation of having a deputy for history and a deputy for archaeology, which is part of a re-organization the SHPO office. The plan is to have three programs that will include: National Register and survey & inventory which will be headed by Bill Collins; create another position for incentives & public programs; and a program for review & compliance which has been filled by Mary-Ellen Walsh as a recent promotion.

Jim Kegan, the Deputy Director of State Parks, is working with Kathryn to develop a sustainable funding solution for SHPO.

**c. Review and Compliance -**

Kathryn Leonard reported they are working on a large-scale project to take the provisions in the current NRCS PA for range improvement projects and to transform them into a Conservation PA that can be used other land management agencies, for project with little or no ground disturbance.

There has been an increase in tribal concerns with projects along the Colorado Rivers and impacts to TCPs, including the Colorado River Regatta, a invasive fish project at Lee's Ferry, and a proposed hotel construction on the banks for the Colorado river.

**d. Survey and Inventory -**

The Temple Historic District in the City of Mesa, which was listed in 2002, associated with the Mormon Temple. Over the past 15 years, an investment arm of the Mormon Church has been buying up the properties in the district with the intention to do a redevelopment of the area, which would include the demolition of most of the buildings within the historic district. This would lead to the first historic district delisting in the state of Arizona, and since it is being done all legally, SHPO has no justification to get involved.

Kathryn reported local controversy regarding murals in historic following a mural festival in the Willo Historic District, and has lead to debates about whether they should be allowed in historic districts.

John Southard noted that due to a Visual Artist Rights Act, any mural may potentially become protected works of art, and a nonreversible feature.

**e. Grants -**

Kathryn Leonard reported that SHPO received their HPF funding from NPS. CLG pass through applications have been received and are being reviewed. SHPO is working with NPS and the Department of Defense to hash out the grant agreement for the Mountain View Officer's Club.

**f. Legislative Issues -**

Kathryn Leonard reported that Governor vetoed HB2498, however Representative Cook has vowed to introduce more legislation to provide relief to the rancher community for ranger conservation projects. SHPO will continue to try to educate the legislature and the Governor's office on regulations and SHPOs work to help streamline the process.

**g. HP 2018 Conference -**

Eric Vondy reported the 2018 conference at the Valley Ho in Scottsdale was very successful and was sold out due to the limited space. It proved to be more costly than originally anticipated, however next year's conference in Prescott, will be cheaper and will allow us to restore some of our funds. The proposed theme for next year is, "Preservation is Everybody's Business."

**F. PUBLIC COMMENT: - (03:21:45)**

None

**G. CALL FOR AGENDA ITEMS FOR NEXT COMMITTEE MEETING:**

- Sunshine Mile Historic District, Tucson
- Herenstien House, Tucson
- Johnson House, Tucson
- Thomas Gist MPDF
- Celebrity Theater, Phoneix

**H. DATES FOR 2018 HSRC MEETINGS:**

March 2nd, 2018 - July 27th, 2018 - November 2nd, 2018

**I. ADJOURNED: (01:58:00)**

The Chair called the meeting adjourned at 1:06 PM

Minutes prepared by: Joseph Roth, State Historic Preservation Office  
and was posted on Wednesday, August 1st, 2018

Minutes are considered draft until official approved by a quorum of the Committee at the next scheduled meeting