

HISTORIC SITES REVIEW COMMITTEE (HSRC)

**Meeting was held via Zoom due to the COVID-19 pandemic.
Friday, November 13th, 2020**

A. CALL TO ORDER PUBLIC SESSION / AND ROLL CALL

- 1. Chair, Terry Majewski called the meeting to order at 9:31 AM**

B. ROLL CALL/INTRODUCTION OF MEMBERS AND STAFF

HSRC Committee Members Present

Terry Majewski, Chair
Don Ryden, Vice Chair
R. Brooks Jeffery
John Jacquemart
Doug Kupel
Karl Eberhard
Jan Balsom
John Southard
Pat Stein

HSRC Committee Members Absent

None

SHPO Staff Members Present

Kathryn Leonard
William (Bill) Collins
Pat Dahlen
Chris Cody
Eric Vondy
Theresa Cano

Guests (logged in via Zoom)

Jennifer Levstik (Cottonwood Preparer)
Ann Pattison
Terry Vesci
Barbara Becker
Chris Evans (Broadmoor Preparer)
Ernie Federico (Pima Community College)
James Wolfe
Jodie Brown (City of Tucson, Historic Preservation Officer)
Linda Duncan
Margy Parisella
Mike Weingarten
Nancy Kate Grayson
Nick & Kim Labriola
Richard Roati
Stephanie Springer
Suzie H.

Terry Quinn
 Bill Ward (Pima Community College, West Campus Vice Chancellor of Facilities - Preparer)
 G. Rodriguez
 Dan Klocke

C. NEW BUSINESS

1. NEW NATIONAL REGISTER NOMINATION

Broadmoor Subdivision Historic District, Tucson, Pima County, Arizona

Collins provided an overview of the Broadmoor Subdivision Historic District nomination.

MOTION TO OPEN DISCUSSION: (14:50)

Balsom moved that the State Historic Preservation Officer place the **BROADMOOR SUBDIVISION HISTORIC DISTRICT** on the Arizona Register of Historic Places at the **LOCAL** level of significance under **CRITERIONS A and C** and that the nomination be forwarded to the Keeper of the National Register for placement in the National Register. The motion was seconded by Southard.

After open discussion, the following recommendations were made by the Committee:

- Strong edit to review if all detail is needed.
- Strengthen justification for why multi-family housing and commercial development is not included in the district, specifically in section 7 and boundary description.
- Clarify that this is the first WWII subdivision to employ a curvilinear design in accordance with FHA standards
- Revisit that the date selected as the end period of significance is the true build-out date.
- Revisit the integrity issues on the margins.
- Bolster Criterion A argument for post-war subdivisions on a national level and what was being accomplished with this sort of FHA desire to create an inward facing type of development.

The Chair called for a vote on the motion, which passed with a vote of 8-1. - (59:15)

Consultant should revise nomination per comments and submit to SHPO for submission to the Keeper.

ROLL CALL VOTE	
Jan Balsom	Y
Karl Eberhard	Y
John Jacquemart	Y
R. Brooks Jeffery	Y
Douglas Kupel	N
Terry Majewski	Y
Don Ryden	Y
John Southard	Y
Pat Stein	Y

KEY

- Y - For
- N - Against
- AB - Abstained
- NP - Not Present

Pima Community College, West Campus, Tucson, Pima County, Arizona

Collins provided an overview of the Pima Community College, West Campus nomination.

MOTION TO OPEN DISCUSSION: (01:11:05)

Jeffery moved that the State Historic Preservation Officer place the **PIMA COMMUNITY COLLEGE, WEST CAMPUS** on the Arizona Register of Historic Places at the **LOCAL** level of significance under **CRITERION C** and that the nomination be forwarded to the Keeper of the National Register for placement in the National Register. The motion was seconded by Eberhard. After open discussion, the following recommendations were made by the Committee:

- Thorough copy edit to fix spelling errors and other inaccuracies.
- Clarify the number of contributing buildings.
- Clarify that this is a district and not a single building.
- Provide updated maps and photographs.
- Needs more detailed integrity assessments of each building including additions and modifications.
- Clarify nomination boundary.
- Describe character defining features and details, finishes.
- Use less interpretive, superlative statements, specifically in Section 7.
- When referencing an architect, reference the firm, not just the specific architect.
- Refine statement as to whether this is a rare, surviving example of a brutalist college building.

Balsom the left meeting at 11:00 a.m. due to another commitment.
Southard was not present for the vote.

The Chair called for a vote on the motion, which did not pass with a vote of 5-1. - (01:44:38)

Consultant should revise nomination per comments and re-present the committee.

ROLL CALL VOTE	
Jan Balsom	NP
Karl Eberhard	N
John Jacquemart	N
R. Brooks Jeffery	N
Douglas Kupel	Y
Terry Majewski	N
Don Ryden	Y
John Southard	NP
Pat Stein	N

KEY

- Y - For
- N - Against
- AB - Abstained
- NP - Not Present

Stein recused herself from the meeting at 11:19 a.m. and Southard returned. (01:52:42)

Hunt Farmstead Historic District, Pine, Gila County, Arizona

Collins provided an overview of the Hunt Farmstead Historic District nomination.

MOTION TO OPEN DISCUSSION: (01:54:40)

Eberhard moved that the State Historic Preservation Officer place the **HUNT FARMSTEAD HISTORIC DISTRICT** on the Arizona Register of Historic Places at the **LOCAL** level of significance under **CRITERION A** and that the nomination be forwarded to the Keeper of the National Register for placement in the National Register. The motion was seconded by Jacquemart. After open discussion, the following recommendations were made by the Committee:

- Include more information about the addition to the main building.
- Include a more nuanced integrity assessment of all the buildings.
- Better assessment of the integrity of the property itself and its setting.
- Include additional information about the Hunts and clarify who is who.
- Clarify that this is the farmstead component and not the homestead component.
- Create a more unified description of the district by looking through the rural historic landscape bulletin.

The Chair called for a vote on the motion, which passed with a vote of 6-1 with 1 abstaining. - (02:24:50)

Consultant should revise nomination per comments and submit to SHPO for submission to the Keeper.

ROLL CALL VOTE	
Jan Balsom	NP
Karl Eberhard	N
John Jacquemart	Y
R. Brooks Jeffery	Y
Douglas Kupel	Y
Terry Majewski	Y
Don Ryden	Y
John Southard	Y
Pat Stein	AB

KEY

- Y - For
- N - Against
- AB - Abstained
- NP - Not Present

Stein returns to the meeting at 11:54 a.m. (02:27:30)

Majewski calls for a short break until noon. (02:27:53-02:33:00)

2. RETURNING NATIONAL REGISTER NOMINATION

Viewpoint (Johnson House) Tucson, Pima County, Arizona

Collins provided an overview of the Viewpoint (Johnson House) nomination.

MOTION TO OPEN DISCUSSION:

Kupal moved that the State Historic Preservation Officer place the **VIEWPOINT (JOHNSON HOUSE)** on the National Register of Historic Places at the **LOCAL** level of significance under **CRITERION C**, and that the nomination be forwarded to the Keeper of the National Register for placement on the National Register. The motion was seconded by Stein.

After open discussion, the following recommendations were made by the Committee.

- Reduce reliance of cut-and-paste from other sources.
- Address issues of property’s integrity.
- Emphasize the local exceptional importance.
- Provide additional information about the guest house in terms of its description and integrity assessment, including photographs
- If possible, include original design plans
- Explanation of why the guest house is the Ryers’s children’s house.
- Strengthen Criterion G paragraph to provide a historical retrospective of Judith Chafee’s significance.

The Chair called for a vote on the motion, which passed with a vote of 8-0. (03:12:26)

Preparer should work with SHPO staff to revise nomination per HSRC comments and submit to SHPO for submission to the Keeper.

ROLL CALL VOTE	
Jan Balsom	NP
Karl Eberhard	Y
John Jacquemart	Y
R. Brooks Jeffery	Y
Douglas Kupel	Y
Terry Majewski	Y
Don Ryden	Y
John Southard	Y
Pat Stein	Y

KEY

- Y - For
- N - Against
- AB - Abstained
- NP - Not Present

3. REVIEW OF FEDERAL NATIONAL REGISTER NOMINATIONS (No action)

North Rim Entrance Road Corridor Historic District, Grand Canyon National Park, Coconino County, Arizona

Collins provided an overview of the North Rim Entrance Road Corridor Historic District nomination.

U.S. Court House and Federal Office Building, Phoenix, Maricopa County, Arizona

Collins provided an overview of the U.S. Court House and Federal Office Building nomination.

Ryden left the meeting at 12:52 p.m.

4. REVIEW OF RETURNED NOMINATION

Cottonwood Commercial Historic District (Boundary Expansion and Additional Documentation), Cottonwood, Yavapai County, Arizona

Collins provided feedback on the returned nomination from the reviewer, Barbara Wyatt, to the committee which included comments on the formatting of the nomination and the significance of the recreation area as it pertains to commerce. Collins informed the committee that the preparer, Levstik, is currently working on revising and resubmitting the nomination to the Keeper.

D. OLD BUSINESS:

1. APPROVAL OF MINUTES FROM July 10th, 2020 HSRC MEETING

MOTION: Kupel called for a motion to accept the minutes as written, Southard seconded the motion.

The chair called for a vote on the motion, and it was passed by a vote of 7-0. (03:39:29)

ROLL CALL VOTE	
Jan Balsom	NP
Karl Eberhard	Y
John Jacquemart	Y
R. Brooks Jeffery	Y
Douglas Kupel	Y
Terry Majewski	Y
Don Ryden	NP
John Southard	Y
Pat Stein	Y

KEY

- Y - For
- N - Against
- AB - Abstained
- NP - Not Present

E. SET HSRC MEETING DATES FOR 2021:

The committee set meeting dates for March, 5; July 9th and November 5, 2021.

F. PROGRAM REPORTS

1. SHPO REPORT

a. National Register update, listings, property status, workflow -

Collins reported on recently approved/updated/delisted listings (Sunshine Mile Historic District, Catalina Townhouses Historic District, Bauder House (Boundary Expansion), and Jefferson Park Historic District (1 property reclassified as non-contributor), Tucson; Bisbee Residential Historic District (Additional Documentation), Bisbee; Clarkdale Historic District (1 property reclassified as contributor); Willo Historic District (1 property reclassified as noncontributor), Avery House, Steinegger Loding House (Demolished/Delisted), Phoenix; and Cottonwood Commercial Historic District (Additional Documentation and Boundary Increase (Returned), Cottonwood) and pending (U.S. Court House and Federal Office Building, Phoenix; Armory Park Historic Residential District

and Sam Hughes Neighborhood Historic District, Tucson; and Tucson Mountain Park Historic District, Pima County) nominations at the Keeper's office.

b. SHPO Staffing and Program News -

Leonard reported that there is no new staffing news. All SHPO programs are up and running. Review and compliance is almost entirely digital as SHPO has directed all federal and state agencies to send reports digitally.

c. Review and Compliance -

Leonard reported SHPO is seeing a continuation of the trend with program comments coming from federal agencies. Program comments are structured alternatives to the Section 106 process. The Department of Defense had been working with the advisory council to do a program comment on interwar housing which is military housing constructed between WWI and WWII. It was implemented. SHPO is reviewing a proposed program comment on SHPO is also looking at program comments from the FCC on the Twilight Towers issue. SHPO executed a parks specific PA on the Montezuma's Castle and Tuzigoot national parks. Resolution Copper remains high on SHPO's radar in terms of compliance. The PA for Resolution Copper is close to being finalized by the U.S.F.S.

SHPO is looking at a potential rule making changes with the Federal Register. The first is a provision that has been filed and is currently under review by the Office of Management & Budget and the Department of Interior involving amount of ownership in a historic district by area rather than one property, one vote. It is up to the SHPO to calculate the percent interest in historic district. The other provision is that the Federal Preservation Officer makes the decision whether a nomination on federal lands moves forward to the Keeper.

d. Survey and Inventory -

Nothing new to report.

e. Grants -

SHPO put out an advertisement on pass through grants amongst our CLGs and those selected will be announced as soon as all CLGs have been notified. SHPO has assisted several non-for-profits in pursuing grants by providing our staff assistant to grant preparation. SHPO has assisted APF in pursuing two grants one from the National Trust and the other from the Humanities Council. SHPO has also assisted the Site Steward Foundation on pursuing a grant for the Project Archaeology program and that grant was awarded in the amount of \$5,000.

f. Legislative Issues -

Leonard reported that it is unknown what this legislative session will look like due to COVID.

g. HP 2020 Conference update –

Leonard reported that the Preservation in Place virtual conference occurred on June 18, 2020 and that the over 600 people registered for the conference. The conference was deemed a success. Leonard reported that Preservation in Place will move forward as a webinar series, the first webinar took place in August focusing on the Dunbar Pavilion in Tucson which was attended by approximately 100 attendees. SHPO will have another webinar November 18. SHPO is still planning on having an in-person conference in June 2021.

G. PUBLIC COMMENT:

None

H. CALL FOR AGENDA ITEMS FOR NEXT COMMITTEE MEETING:

Majewski reported that the Tucson/Pima County Historical Commission created a task force on inclusivity in naming of city owned buildings and they are creating a report that they may have questions or concerns for Leonard.

I. ADJOURNED:

The Chair called the meeting adjourned at 1:51 p.m.

Minutes prepared by: Theresa Cano, State Historic Preservation Office
and was posted on Wednesday, November 18, 2020

Minutes are considered draft until official approved by the Committee at the next scheduled meeting